DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 248 476 CS 007 756

AUTHOR	Doltas, Dilek; Sevgen, Cevza
TITLE	Introspection and Essay Studies Conducted in Turkey. Fairytale: An Interdisciplinary Turco-Danish Study of the Collective v. the Individual Nature of the Response to Literature. Report No. 12. Revised.
INSTITUTION	Bosphorus Univ., Istanbul (Turkey). Dept. of Language and Literature.; Copenhagen Univ. (Denmark). Dept. of English.
PUB DATE	3 Dec 82
NOTE	139p.; Sponsored jointly by Unesco, NATO, and the Danish Research Council for the Humanities. For related documents, see CS 007 745-759.
PUB TYPE	Reports - Research/Technical (143)
EDRS PRICE	MF01/PC06 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS	Essays; *Folk Culture; Foreign Countries; Higher Education; *Literature Appreciation; *Reader Response; Reading Comprehension; Reading Habits; *Reading Interests; *Reading Research; Secondary Education; Student Reaction
IDENTIFIERS	Denmark; *Fairy Tales; *Response to Literature; Turkey

ABSTRACT

As part of the interdisciplinary Turko-Danish Fairytale Project, both an introspection and an essay study were conducted with Turkish university prep-school students and junior college students to determine their responses to three fairytales: "The Snake, the Fox, and the Man," "The Gold Apple," and "Per Smed's Whip." The 63 readers in the introspection study were given the texts of the three tales, one by one, and were asked to report on what they experienced during the actual reading of each tale. After their commentary, the readers were asked, among other things, whether they liked the story and what the meaning of the story was. After they had read all three tales, the readers were asked whether they had read or heard of the stories before, which of the stories they liked best, which of the stories were most familiar, and which of the stories were most alien. The 61 readers who participated in the essay study were asked to write summaries of each tale and to answer questions that were identical to those in the introspection studies. Most of the readers for the introspection study reported that they had never heard of the stories before, liked "The Gold Apple" best and found it most familiar, and found "Per Smed's Whip" the most alien. Most of the readers for the essay study reported they had never heard or read the stories previously, preferred "The Snake, The Fox, and The Man," found "The Gold Apple" most familiar, and found "Per Smed's Whip" the most alien. (Extensive examples of student comments on the fairy tales are appended.) (HOD)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED248476

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

X This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization orginating it.

Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official NIE position or policy.

FAIRYTALE

An Interdisciplinary Turco-Danish Study of the Collective v. the Individual Nature of the Response to Literature

Report No. 12

Title: INTROSPECTION AND ESSAY STUDIES CONDUCTED IN TURKEY

Author(s)/Editor(s): Dilek Doltaş, Cevza Sevgen

Date, original: Spring 1981

Revised: Nov.'81, March'82, July'82.

Last Revision: 3, Dec. 1982

Addresses

Denmark:

c/o Cay Dollerup
Department of English
University of Copenhagen
Njalsgade 84-96
DK-2300 Copenhagen S
Denmark

Turkey:

c/o Dilek Doltaş
Department of Language and Literature
Boğaziçi University, P.K.2
Bebek
Istanbul
Turkey

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Cay Dollerup

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

CS 007 756

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We would like to thank the administration, the staff members and the students of the Boğaziçi University prep-school (The School of English Language), our department secretary Neylan Gönlüyüce who typed out most of the manuscript, our project assisstants Derya Demir, Deniz Tarba, Murat Seçkin and Aaron Aji who spent days and weeks poring over the commentaries. Last but not least our thanks are due to our students, colleagues and friends who kindly participated in the introspection study.

THE INTROSPECTION AND ESSAY STUDIES CONDUCTED IN TURKEY

1. Purpose:

The purpose of this study was to gather the necessary information for the setting up of a preliminary questionnaire based on the key phrases deduced from the commentary on the introspection and essay studies.

The present report is concerned only with the procedure followed by the Turkish team in conducting the above mentioned studies and in classifying the results. The study is the one discussed in Report No.5,p.7.

2. The Experimental Set-Up:

A. The Introspection Studies:

The introspection studies were conducted by the members of the Turkish team and three project assisstants. The readers were given the texts of the three tales, one by one and they were asked to report on what they experienced during the actual reading of each tale. The experimenter did not interfere with the reading of the texts but merely asked the reader to elaborate on his/her comment whenever a comment was made. This was done by posing non-directive questions like "why", "how" and "where". The experimenter was not allowed to express any sort of approval, disapproval or the like. The readers were free to comment on the text either as they read along or after they were through with the reading. After their free commentary on one of the tales was recorded, the readers were asked the following questions about that tale:

1. Did you like the story?
2. What is the meaning of the story?
3. Are there any symbolic elements in the story? If yes, what?
4. Are there any universal elements in the story? If yes, what?
5. Is there anything else you would like to comment on?

After all three tales were read and the free commentary recorded, the readers were asked the following questions:

1. Have you read/heard any of these stories before?
2. Which of the stories did you like best?
3. Which of the stories did you find most familiar?
4. Which of the stories did you find most alien?

In the intrespection study, 63 readers were asked to read the following tales:

The Snake, The Fox and The Man

The Gold Apple

Per Smed's Whip

The order of the tales were varied from reader to reader so that any given tale occurred as the first in the sequence for some readers, as the middle tale for others, and as the final tale for the rest. This was done in order to minimize the biases which may result from a fixed sequence of texts (See Report No.5, pp 11-13).

The Classification of the Participants according to sex, age and educational background:

Total number of participants: 63

Sex: 29 women
32 men
2 unidentified

Age: 17-19 yrs. old. ..... 6 readers
20-29 " " ..... 39 "
30-39 " " ..... 9 "
40-45 " " ..... 3 "
unknown ..... 6 "

Education: Primary school ..... 2 readers
Lyceé education ..... 2 "
University education.. 42 "
Graduate and post-graduate education ..... 12 readers
Unidentified ..... 5 readers

Codification:

Each participant was given a code based on his/her sex, age and education.

The codification was as follows:

I stands for the introspective study.
F " " Female.
M " " Male.
A " " age group 17-19 years.
B " " age group 20-25 years.
C " " age group 25-35 years.
D " " 35 yrs. and above
1-99 " " primary education
100-199 " " lyceé education
200-299 " " university education (student)
300-399 " " university graduate

400-499 stands for graduate student
500-599 " " graduate with a degree
H " " Human Sciences
(including economics, literature, sociology and the like)
S " " Sciences
(including engineering physics, chemistry medicine and the like).

example: I FB 205 H: Introspection study participant; female; age group 20-25; university student; majoring in human sciences.

The Readers:

Although the "core group" to be used in the project will comprise Boğaziçi University prep School and Junior College students, the majority of the readers who were asked to participate in the introspection study were junior and senior year students at the university, and graduates and post-graduates. This was done because these older groups had had more experience in reading texts of all sorts and thus were expected to be more conscious readers and also more articulate in expressing their ideas. Indeed, the purpose of the introspection study was to ensure as wide and varied a spectrum of responses as possible. Moreover the actual decision about what "special groups" are to be used in the main study had not yet been made at the time these studies were done.

B. The Essay Study:

The essay study was conducted by the members of the Turkish team and one student assistant. The readers were handed out the texts of the three tales, arranged in varying order, along with questions appended to each tale and also a final group of questions coming at the end.

The readers were given an hour and a half in which to read the tales, to summarize each tale and to answer the questions. The instructions given out orally at the beginning of the session were identical with those in Denmark.(See Internal Danish Report on the Essay Study dated 11.5.81) The readers were asked to indicate their age and sex on the first page of the texts.

Apart from the summaries that were asked to be written after each tale, the questions asked both at the end of each tale and at the very end were identical with those in the introspection studies.

61 readers took part in the essay study.

Codification:

E stands for Essay Study.

The codification of the age groups follows those in the introspection studies.

In the essay study, the educational background was constant for all readers, ie. all were lyceé graduates doing their prep year at the university and therefore they were all classified under 200-ranging from 200 to 261. Since they had not yet specialized in a particilar field, no distinction was made according to their majors (ie. human sciences versus the sciences).

The Readers:

Unlike the introspection study, the essay study sought to record the comments on and the evaluation of the tales by our core group. So all the 61 readers were from the Boğaziçi University prep school. They were asked to participate in the study at one sitting and all together. Care was taken not to make them feel they were in a classroom situation.

3. The Classification of the material:

A. The data collected in the two studies was broken down in the following way for each tale (except for the final questions posed at the end of the two studies):

The Indicators: Each time a reader commented on a point in the tale (a word, a phrase, a section, or a character or a group of characters, or an idea, a symbol etc.) this was recorded and the point of departure in the text which triggered the comment was indicated. Later all these comments were identified by code, and arranged within the chronological order of the tale.

The Meaning of the Tale: The answers given to this question, along with what was deduced from the summaries and the general commentaries, were classified in terms of particular messages given and over-all interpretations of the meaning of the tales.

The Characters: In the case of the Snake, the comments on the characters were made in terms of groups of characters, and their relations with one another. The readers saw the individual characters as symbols and the question on symbolism evoked answers which could alternatively have been categorized under the heading of characters. However, since other elements in the tale (like the fire, the saddle etc) were also cited as symbolic, it was more accurate to classify the comments on the symbolic aspects of characters in the section on symbolism.

In the case of The Gold Apple and Per Smed's Whip, the comments on the characters were quite straightforward and fell conveniently under the appropriate heading.

Symbolism: The answers given to the question on symbolism along with what could be extracted from the summaries came under this heading. Some of the answers given to this question indicated that the reader had not quite grasped the question, and was not quite sure what symbolism meant. However, all the comments, whether relevant or not, were recorded and classified.

The Universal Elements: Once again, the answers given to this question indicate that about one fifth of the readers were not quite sure what was meant by the concept of universality.

Style: Although no questions were posed on style, quite a number of readers commented on this aspect of the tales, either as they read along, in the introspection study, or in answering question 5, after each tale. Therefore a section on style became necessary. Discussions on style, ranging from comments on narrative genres to the use of the language in the tales, were further broken down under appropriate subheadings.

B. The break-down of the answers given to the final 4 questions posed both after the completion of the introspection and the essay studies are as follows:

The Introspection Study:

1. The reader has heard/read the story previously:

The Gold Apple:8	Per Smed's Whip:3	The Snake:9
All:3	Similar story:7	None:35

2. The story which the reader liked best:

The Gold Apple:27	Per Smed's Whip:10	The Snake:25
All:4	None:6	

3. The story which the reader found most familiar:

The Gold Apple:31	Per Smed's Whip:7	The Snake:21
All:9	None:1	

4. The story which the reader found most alien:

The Gold Apple:10	Per Smed's Whip:32	The Snake:7
All:2	None:14	

The Essay Study:

1. The reader has heard/read the story previously:

The Gold Apple:2	Per Smed's Whip:--	The Snake:4
All:--	Similar story:2	None:31

2. The story which the reader liked best:

The Gold Apple:2	Per Smed's Whip:—	The Snake:13
All:4	None:7	

3. The story which the reader found most familiar:

The Gold Apple:6	Per Smed's Whip:--	The Snake:5
All:8	None:6	

4. The story which the reader found most alien:

The Gold Apple:1	Per Smed's Whip:10	The Snake:1
All:2	None:16	

The classification of the comments recorded in the introspection and essay studies is presented in the following section.

THE CLASSIFIED COMMENTARIES RECORDED IN THE INTROSPECTION AND ESSAY STUDIES

THE INDICATORS

The Title:

- Animals may be grouped together leaving man aside or/Fox and the Man may form a group leaving The Snake alone.
  IFB 205H.

- Title is worth noting. The appearance of "The Snake" foreshadows a more interesting relation.
  IFD 507H.

The Tree:

- Its being on fire is an objective realization of the immediate difficulty.

- Stands for the bad turns in life.

The Fire:

- Draws one to itself.
  IMB 228H.

- Stands for the dilemma the man finds himself in.
  IMB 203H.

The Stick:

- First functions as a saviour, but later is a cause of death.
  IMC 404H.

The Hissing Sound:

- Snakes do not whistle (hissing sound was rendered as "whis tling" in Turkish)
  IFD 304H.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Snake About To Be Burnt:

- Snakes do not let themselves be consumed by fire, they slide off the tree.
  IFD 507H, IFD 2.

The Snake Coiled Itself:

- Men are not alike. I would have killed a snake if I saw one.
  IMA 210H, IMC 1.

- The man saves the snake because of his goodness.
  IFD 2.

- It's strange that a huge big snake should seek the help of a simple man to save himself from the fire.
  IMB 214S.

- I would not have saved it, let the snake burn.

- It's a cold animal. (sic)
  IMB 305H, IMC 1.

- Expelled from paradise by God himself.
  IFD 2.

- The man is not sceptical.

The Snake Being Ungrateful, Trying To Swallow The Man:

- Swallowing stands for wrath.
  IMB 214S.

- True to type.
  IFD 508H.

- The snake does not bite but tries to swallow, why?
  IFD 507H, IFB 215H.

- It must be a huge snake if it can swallow a man.
  IFB 211S.

- Does he want to wipe out man from the world?
  IFD 507H.

- He identifies this particular man with mankind.
  IMA 212S, IFA 207H.

- Can one hold responsible a representative of a species for a wrong done by that species?

- Man proves to be good in spite of all bad verdicts about his species.
  IFD 507H.

- The snake behaves in "consistent" logical way in wanting to swallow the man.
  IMB 209H.

- The man when swallowed, is incorporated with Evil.
  IFD 507H.

- The conflict between the snake and the man took in too short a time and was unexpected.
  IFD 507H.

Let's Consult A Judge:

- They seek other people's opinion on the subject before they come to a decision.
  IMA 103H.

- The snake is consenting to go to a judge.
  IMD 505H.

- The snake is stupid. Why should he consent to go to a judge?

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

- If he believes he is right he ought to have swallowed the man right away.

- At the beginning the snake lacks a sense of justice and rationality, but here all of a sudden, he consents to appeal his case before a judge.

- Inconsistent characterization of the snake.

- Rather than consenting he should have been forced to submit to a judge.
  IMD 505H.

- His initial evil is inconsistent with his later tolerance.
  IFB 219H.

- It is the snake who made Eve eat the apple.
  IMB 228H.

- In his dealing with man, he has enough good will to consult a judge.

- He is stubborn and insists on swallowing the man.
  IFB 211S.

- There is also a naive side to his character, like giving man a second chance.
  IMC 202S.

- The snake is a realist.

- He is an abstraction.
  IFB 201H.

The Ass:

- The ass is sore and biased against mankind.
  IFA 221H, IFD 2.

- His judgement is distorted because of the grudge he bears against mankind.
  IFA 221H.

- He too identifies this particular man with mankind.
  IFA 207H, IFD 504H.

- The animal who carries burdens and is constantly humiliated.

- He takes a one-sided view of things.

- His being a judge is ironic.
  IMB 228H.

- All animals are created to serve mankind; it should not complain for bearing a saddle and doing chores for man.
  IFD 2.

- The ass has always been the underdog exploited by mankind so he seeks vengeance when the opportunity arises.
  IFD 507H.

- The ass's exploitation by man stands for the usual maltreatment of the ass by mankind.

- The ass represents all nature in voicing his hatred for man and in his desire in vengeance.
  IFD 508H.

- The narrator is being unfair to the ass in representing him as cruel-which it's not.
  IMD 505H.

- The ass is right.
  IFB 229H.

Going To A Second Judge:

- The man wants to bend justice to his own advantage.
  IFA 221H, IMB 228H.

- This is the rationale for seeking a second judge.

The Horse's Judgement:

- The horse is a fair judge.
  IFB 224S.

- We expect him to deliver a judgement against man, however he judges fairly.
  IFD 507H.

- The horse is servile.
  IFB 229H.

- The horse is loyal to mankind so it wishes to help man.
  IMA 101S.

- The horse is treated with more respect and kindness by man.
  That's why he judges a)fairly, b)in favour of man.

- The horse serves mankind without expecting anything in return.
  IFB 229H.

- The horse too is exploited but remains loyal to man.
  IFC 220H.

- The horse listens to the voice of his conscience.
  IFA 221H, IFD 504H.

- He is tolerant and mild.
  IMC 202S.

- He has common sense.

- It's evil, a collaborator.

- It judges the particular case and does not identify this particular man with mankind at large.

- The burden put on the ass and the horse is similar. So why do they render different judgements?

IFB 219H.

When The Fox Saw The Snake Coiled Round The Man:

- He thinks whatever the trouble is, it is between the snake and the man and does not concern itself (i.e. the fox) and does not run away.
  IFD 507H, IFD 508H.

- When the fox sees the snake, it's scared, but when he realizes that the snake is coiled round the man, it is delighted and ready to speak.
  IFD 507H, IFA 221H.

The Fox Being The Third And Last Judge:

- Logical because the fox is considered the most cunning of animals.
  IMB 209H.
- not very clear did he get involved simply for the bribe, or did he really wish to be a judge? EFA 202

The man sigualling To The Fox:

- The fact that the fox interprets the signal as the promise of a bribe is indicative of his scheming nature.
  IFD 507H, IMA 210H, IFA 207H, IFB 230H, IMB 214S, IFC 218H.

- The signal shows the cunning resourcefullness of the man.
  IFA 207H, IFB 230H.

- The fox's immediate comprehension shows how clever it is.
  IFD 507H, IFA 207H.

- It shows that it will do anything to serve his ends.
  IFD 508H.

- The man uses bribery to attain his ends.
  IFB 301H, IMC 225H.

- Man is the true lord of nature.
  IFB 230H.

- He tries to save his skin through his intelligence.
  IFB 206H.

- How can the fox possibly comprehend the signal?
  IFB 219H, IMB 214S.

To This Deal It Gladly Consented:

- A sign of the fox's greed, his opportunism.
  IFB 211S, IMB 209H.

- A cunning animal but less clever than the man's wife.

- A collaborator.
  IFA 207H, IFB 229H.

- This shows that he will give a biased verdict.
  IFC 507H.

- It will save the man because of the offered bribe.
  IMD 505H.

- The fox and the man make up a team.
  IFB 205H.

- The fox likes to meddle in other people's business.

- A type that will do anything to serve his own advantage.
  IFB 206H.

The Fox Makes The Snake Go Up The Tree:

- The snake, the less clever animal is put in a fix by the fox.

- He exercises duplicity.
  IFB 211S.

Just As The Man Was About To Push His Staff Between The Branches:

- This shows:

- the man's instinctive goodness.
  IFD 507H.
- the man's stupidity.
  IFC 220H.
- his naïvité.

- The man should not save the snake, mankind does not like snakes.
  IFA 221H.

- Ref. to the Bible and the Koran.
  IFC 218H.

- The fox is destructively cunning here.
  IMA 101S.

The Man Was Very Happy To Be Saved:

- At this point in the story, a few readers said that the man was naive in thinking that his life was saved because they imagined he would lose his life at the end.
  IFD 507H, IFD 508H.

- The fox did right by saving a man from a snake.
  IFD 2, IMC 1.

- The fox gives back the man his life. (sic)
  (The reader approved of this.)

The Man Took A Sack:

- Hens are not caught in this way. The narrator is wrong in giving such a description.
  IFD 2.

- His heart prompts him to stick to his word.
  IFD 506H, IFC 402H.

- His actually intends to take the hens to the fox.

The Man Says "You're Right Wife":

- This shows his naïvité and that he functions as a tool.
  IFC 220H.

The Man Put The Dog Into The Sack:

- The woman is the cleverest of all.
  IFC 220H, IFB 230H, IFD 507H.

- She saves her husband from animal kind.
  IFA 221H.

- She is the true ruler of nature.
  IFB 206H, IFC 220H.

- She is an opportunist.

- She is able to channel her husband's thoughts in the direction she wants and to impose her own will on him.
  IFD 507H, IMD 505H.

- She is more quick-witted and cunning than the man.
  IFA 207H.

- This clever act should have been thought of by the man, and not the woman.
  IFB 301H, IMC 404H, IFD 504H.

- The woman interferes and tells the man what to do though she does not really know what has been going on.
  IFD 401H, IMA 101S, IMA 103S.

- The woman is responsible for twisting his character.

- Because of her selfishness, he too acts in a selfish way.
  IMD 505H.

- She is selfish.
  IFD 504H.

- She is more materialistic than the man.
  IFC 220H.

- She is deceitful.

- The fact that the woman does not part with the hens indicates that man does not wish to give up his rights and property.

- The man does not keep his promise.
  IFB 229H, IFB 230H.

- He is easily influenced.
  IFD 401H, IFD 507H, IMA 101S.

- She is the type who deserves the punishment of the animals who thought to inflict it on her husband.
  IFD 507H.

- The man is the greatest fool, even more stupid than the ass.
  IFD 401H.

- The man has no integrity.
  IMD 505H.

- He goes along with whatever is suggested to him.
  IMB 209H.

- The stupidest of all animals.
  IFD 401H.

- The man can not keep his innocence, he tricks the trickster and by doing this he impairs his character.
  IFC 402H.

- The man is afflicted by deceit and human weakness.
  IFA 207H.

The Fox Wags His Tail:

- This description implies that the fox is a domestic animal which in fact he is not.
  IFD 507H.

But Of Course, Shortly Afterwards:

- Many readers found this sentence:
  A) stylistically peculiar
     IFD 507H.
  B) incomprehensible
     IFD 507H.

Who Are You To Set Yourself Up As A Judge?:

- Strange, he did not act as a proper judge.
  IFC 220H.

- Strange, he did not get involved in order to act fairly as a judge but simply for the bribe.
  IFD 504H.

- Strange, the fox indentifies itself with man.
  IFD 507H.

- Why does the story end with the fox? It's not afterall the protagonist.
  IFB 219H.

- He is afraid of the dog and flees.
  IFD 304H.

- The fox suffers a temporary defeat.
  IFC 402H.

- He is treacherous but he regrets the unfairness at the end.
  IFA 221H, IFD 507H.

THE MEANING OF THE TALE

The story gives the following messages:

- Animals should be loyal to mankind.
  IMC 1, IFD 2.

- Clever and quick-witted ones always get the best of everyone else.
  IFB 229H.

- People are not true to one another. EMA 201

- People bear grudges. EMA 201

-People try to get rich quick. EMA 201

- The men of good intentions are thwarted in the process. EMA 201, EFA 203
- There are different vantage points from which the same event is to be viewed. EMA 216
- Commonsense and [illegible] wisdom are the victors over cunning. EMB 240
- The dishonest man has no security. EMA 222

- Mutual relations are devoid of reciprocal trust.
  IFD 307H, IFA 207H, IFB 223S, IMB 305H, IFB 215H, IMB 216H, IFB 201H, EFA 218

- Men do not fulfill their pledges once they attain their ends.
  IMC 225H, EFA 228, EMB 248

- Once you make up your mind, put your decision straight into action.
  EFA 215
- Don't meddle in other people's affairs.
  IFB 211S, IMB 226H, IFB 219H, IFB 306H, EFA 215, EMA 224

- Don't let others meddle in yours.
  IFB 306H, EFA 215

- A good turn loses its value as soon as it is performed.
  EFA 230
- One should only trust his own species.
  IMC 202S, EMA 214
- There is nothing that men won't do for his self-interest. EFA 215
- Everything is based on self-interest.
  IFB 301H, IMA 212S, IMB 233H, IFB 224S, EFA 230

- Be selfish! EMA 232

- People should know whom tc help, how to treat others and in what manner. EMB 238

- We should't trust others until we get to know them. EFB 252

- We can never be sure that one who decieves others will not decieve us as well. EFA 204

- Men try to attain by foul means what they fail to attain by the fair. IFD 504H, EFA 204

- When in trouble, there is nothing that man won't do. EFA 204

- Showing mercy doesn't pay. IFB 211S, EMA 226

- Helping those who have no moral code merely works to our disadvantage.

- Never help those in need. IFD 504H.

- Never be just. IFD 504H.

- In societies where bribery pays, things have a tendency to go wrong. IFB 215H.

- No one should decieve or cheat another. IFD 2, EFA 219

- One ought to think of the consequences of an action at the very beginning. (sic) IMA 210H, IMC 404H, IFB 306H, EFA 207

- One should trust no one but himself. IFD 307H, IFA 207H, IMB 209H, EMA 206, EFA 207, EFA 225, EMA 232

- Having a blind trust in one will lead to problems and disappointments in this cruel world. IFA 221H, EMB 241, EMB 250

- People can not be honest with each other at all times.
  EFA 235

- It's naive to expect goodness to be returned.
  IFC 309H, IMA 210H, EMB 249, EMB 251

- Might always wins out.(the man: might)
  IMB 227H, EFA 234

- Men should not help his enemy. (enemy: the snake)
  EMB 244

- Helping others is both good and bad.
  IFB 205H, IFB 306H, IMB 223H, EMB 249

- When one can not solve his own problems and has to seek help from others, he will find himself in a fix.
  IMB 228H.

-It's not a sure bet that greed and cunning will succeed.
  IFB 211S, IFC 220H, EMA 210, EMA 217, EFA 220, EMB 241, EMB 248, EFB 253

- Men arouse feelings of vengeance in other creatures because they exploit and abuse them.
  IFB 230H.

- Mankind is weird; animals are always exploited. EFA 233
- Everyone does what is best for himself.
  IFD 307H, IFB 206H.

- We must not expect reward for the help we give to others.
  IFD 2, IFB 306H, IFB 230H.

- One must not alter one's personality even at the cost of defeat, that is, one should preserve one's established value system.
  IFC 402H.

- No one should judge another person without having all the relevant information.
  IFD 401H, EFA 223

- Fair play does not pay.
  IFD 504H.

- Keep away from those engaged in a quarrel.

- Goodwill is not enough..... Not a good lesson.

- Man can reach his goal through his cleverness and by exercising deceit.
  IFB 230H.

- Everyone for himself.
  IMB 305H, IFB 201H, EFA 220

- Friendship based on selfish motives will not be a rewarding one.
  IFB 223S.

- In times of difficulty, man may feel powerless and take the wrong decisions, but on the other hand, once they have the upper-hand, they may employ their wits to bad ends.
  IMB 204H.

- Flatter or bear with one whom you can not stand until you attain your own ends. (a Turkish proverb)

- Trade has its own rules. If you break them, you'll suffer for it. Make sure that you get your money for the goods you sell, or else....
  IMC 403S.

- Conscience, self-interest, malice or charity co-exist in man and are in constant conflict.
  IMB 214S

- No one can be thought of and evaluated independently.
  IMB 214S.

- Those who are after fooling others fool themselves.
  IFD 304H, IFA 221H, IFD 504H.

- Goodness is innate and a man exercising his intellect does not help others but he also does not bend his mind to evil.
  IFD 507H.

- Do not torture. (moral lesson)
  IFB 206H.

The story is about:

- The conflict between good and evil, plus the factors which contribute to the defeat of the evil ones.
  IFB 230H.

- Man versus his environment.
  IMB 305H, IFB 230H.

- Human relationships. IMB 203H
- " the impossible " EFB 253
- Trust.(sic)EFB 242 EMB 240
- It underlines the reason, the oppurtunism and the selfishness of humankind.(sic)
- The conflict of interests among creatures.(various species)
  IFB 208H.
- Selfishness.EMB 251

- The conflict of interests among individual beings.
  IMB 216H, IFB 201H. EMA 227, EFB 246

- Men who get progressively more selfish.

- The inseperability of good and evil.
  EMB 245

- Ingratitude.
  IFD 504H, EMB 244

- The changeability of the reasons underlying a good deed, (i.e. helping others)
  IMB 203H.

- Human relationships within the norms of the capitalist system. The story discusses how these are related to the system. (a small group of exploiters and consciously or unconsciously exploited groups, some of which are collaborators) EFB 246

- How trying it is to be put in the role of a judge. This is true especially if self-interest clouds the judgement. It may then result in punishment for the judge.
  IFD 401H, IMC 404H, IFB 224S, IFD 508H, EMB 243

- Power struggle in society.
  IMB 227H.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

- The objectivity of a man, when put in the role of a judge, is debatable.
  EFA 202, EFA 220

- The success of man as a result of the dissonance and lack of co-operation among animals.
  IFA 207H.

- A moral dilemma: should one hold a person responsible for the crimes of his species and to what extent does an individual represent the fame and blame of his species? Instead of solving this dilemma the story simply abandons it. Perhaps the message is that one should not get involved with dilemmas that can not easily be resolved.
  IFD 401H, IFD 506H, IMA 103S, IMB 228H, IFB 208H, EMA 212

- A Turkish proverb turned inside out: "The man in danger of being drowned will hold on to a snake." But the man in the role of the snake does not act like a snake, moreover the snake bites the hand that feeds it.
  IMC 202S.

- One - up - manship.
  IMB 231H.

- The problems arising from prejudices and solutions based on self-interest.

- The questioning of the final judgement.
  IMB 233H.

- The relativity of justice.
  IFB 205H, IFB 215H, IMC 225H, IMB 228H, IMA 102S.

- The problems of acting as a judge.
  IMB 203H, IMB 227H.

- The fact that in spite of the dependence of one's interests on others, we still act selfishly.
  IMC 202S.

- The necessity to question certain values and institutions rather than accepting them wholesale.
  IMC 403S.

- The difficulty of distiuquishing right from wrong. EMA 209
- The animal called man is so greedy that he will not hesitate to injure others for him own ends. EFA 204
- The man as a naive, cunning and selfish creature is not able to free himself from beastly and/or humanly (measure for measure) values. EMA 231

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

The overall evaluation of the meaning of the tale:

- It's a realistic tale. EFA 230, EMA 229, EMA 232, EMB 241, EMB 240, EMB 243
- The story forces us to reexamine one's actions.
  EFA 218
- This story would have negative influence on those who do not have the ability to think for themselves.
- The story contains no moral message.
  IFD 504H.
- Though the story appears to be superficial, it has a certain depth.
  IFB 201H, EMB 251
- It is a tale which fosters individualism.
  IMB 305H, IFB 205H.
- The story has positive types and a positive end in view.
- The story has political overtones.
  IFC 402H.
- It has no clear message.
  IFB 206H, IFB 219H, IMB 222H, EMA 222, EFA 234
- The story has no meaning.
  IMB 213S, IMD 505H.
- It's didactic.
  IMC 308H, IMB 209H, IMA 210H, IFD 304H, IFB 224S, EFA 205, EMA 210, EFA 218, EFA 219, EFA 220, EFA 223, EFB 242
- It's too didactic.
  IFB 219H.
- Its sole aim is to give a lesson.
  IMB 203H, EFA 207
- It is a nice funny story.
  IMB 217H.

- It is a stupid tale. (sic)
  IFB 206H.

- It's good for children, pedagocical and educational.
  IMB 213S, IMA 102S.

- In spite of the fairy tale framework, there is no pedagocical message in the story.
  IMD 505H, IFB 215H.
- Meaningless for me, but perhaps an entertaining story for children. EMA 213

- I didn't like it, it's one of the cliché stories. EMB 244

RELATIONSHIPS (i.e. CHARACTERS)

Man And Animals:

- God created the animals to serve mankind.
  IFD 2.

- Men oppress all creatures excluding his own species.
  IFC 220H.

- Oxen and horses know their masters.
  IFD 2.

- The underdogs always turn out to be the animals.

- The two-sides are in constant conflict.

The Man And The Snake:

- The snake is the natural enemy of man.
  IFA 221H, IFD 506H, IFC 218H.

- This relationship parallels that between the fox and the man.
  IFD 504H.

- This relationship resembles that in the scriptures.
  IMB 228H, IFC 218H.

The Man And The Ass:

- The man has always exploited the ass.
  IFB 206H, IMB 228H.

- This relationship is similar to the relationship between
  A) the boss and the worker.
  B) the white man and the Negro.
  IMB 217H.

- The man may exploit the ass, but must not let it go hungry.
  IFD 2.

The Man And The Horse:

- Although the horse has the same function as the ass, the man treats the horse with more respect and affection.
  IFC 218H, IFD 507H.

- The horse associates himself with man.
  IFD 401H.

- The horse acts almost like a collaborator.

The Man And The Fox:

- Together they form a group. (sic)
  IFA 207H, IFA 221H.

- They are both very cunning.
  IFA 207H, IFA 221H, IFB 229H.

- Mankind proves to be more cunning than the most cunning animal.
  IFA 207H, IFA 221H, IFB 206H, IFD 304H.

- The man does not keep his word to the fox.
  IFB 206H, IFA 207H, IFA 221H.

- The man should have kept his word to the fox.
  IFD 504H.

The Snake And The Fox:

- A careful animal: is afraid of the fox.

The Snake And The Ass:

- Both have been exploited by man.
  IFB 208H.

The Ass And The Horse:

- They have the same function but they give different, contradictory verdicts.

- They both are ineffectual in the final verdict.
  IFB 205H.

- These two represent people who judge in accordance with their own prejudices and self-interest when asked to mediate in a conflict they are not directly involved in.

The Man And His Wife:

- The wife dominates the man.
  IMD 505H.

- Her husband has no importance in her eyes.

- He is under her influence.
  IFD 507H.

- She is pragmatic.
  IFD 506H.

The Wife And The Fox:

- The wife's mind functions like the mind of the fox.
  IMA 101S.

SYMBOLISM

The Snake:

- Symbol of faithlessness.
  IFB 229H.

- Symbol of unreliability.
  IMB 204H, IFB 229H, EFA 207

- Symbol of betrayal.
  IMC 403S, IFB 223S, IFB 224S, EFA 203, EFA 215, EMB 249

- Symbol of vengeance.
  IFB 206H, IFB 229H, EMA 201, EMB 241

- Not a symbol of evil, he's afterall a creature of nature and therefore does not arouse antipathy.
  IFC 402H.

- Ungrateful.
  IMC 202S, IFB 229H, EMA 212, EMA 217, EFA 220, EFA 223, EFB 252, EFB 253

- Symbolizes a racist attitute.
  IFB 229H.

- Symbolizes fiendish man.

- The symbol of struggle for survival.
  IFA 221H.

- Symbol of cold-bloodedness.

- Symbol of alienation.
  IMB 305H.

- Symbol of hypocracy.

- Symbol of treachery.
  IMB 209H.

- Symbol of an underdog. EFB 246

- Symbol of fickleness. EMA 227

- Symbol of slyness.
  IMB 203H.

- Symbol of stupidity.
  IFA 221H, EFA 233

- Symbolizes those double-dealers who pursue self-serving ends.
  EFA 234
- Symbol of a bully.

- Symbol of untrustworthiness.

- Symbol of the unbending and powerful personality.
  EFA 219
- Symbol of the enemy.
  EMB 244

- Symbol of those who lack self-knowledge.
  IFC 220H.

- Symbol of one-track mindedness.
  IFC 220H.

- Symbol of conservatism. (sic)
  IMB 216H.

- Symbol of punishment.
  IFD 507H.

- Symbol of evil.
  IFD 307H, IFC 309H, IMA 210H, IFA 221H, IFD 304H, IFB 211S, IFB 205H, IMB 222H, IFD 401H, IFD 507H, IMB 216H, IMA 102S, IMB 213S, EMA 206, EFA 215, EMA 217, EFA 225, EMA 226, EMA 227, EFA 228, EMB 249

The Ass:

- Symbol of stupidity.
  IMB 228H, IFD 401H.

- A symbol of those who do not resist exploitation.
  EMA 217, EFA 219, EFA 225, EMA 227
- Who do not speak up against injustice and bullying.
  EMA 227
- Who are condemned to be the underdog.
  IFB 206H, EFB 246

- Who wish to have his own exploiters and exploited by bigger bullies.
  IFD 504H, IMC 225H, IMB 228H, EMA 217, EFA 234, EMB 241, EMB 249

- Symbol of slyness.
  IMC 403S.

- Symbol of enmity. EMB 244

- Symbol of relationships that are based on mutual self-interest.
  IFB 223S.

- A symbol for those who are exploited and therefore can not think straight.
  IMB 222H, IFB 229H, IFB 230H, IMA 101S, IFB 215H, IFC 220H, IFB 224S, IMC 225H, IFC 220H, IFB 229H, EFA 223

- Symbol of "fair play". (sic)
  IFD 504H.

- Symbol of vengeance.
  IFC 220H.

- Symbol of one-track-mindedness.
  IFC 220H.

- A symbol of man's lack of mercy.
  IFB 201H.

- A symbol selfishness. EMA 216

- A symbol of a realistic approach to life.
  IMB 203H.

- A symbol of subjective judgement.
  IFB 224S.

- A symbol for those who hold grudges.
  IMB 214S. EMA 201

- A symbol for those who take things emotionally rather than objectively.
  IMB 216H.

- Symbol of man.(sic) EFA 230

Saddle:

- Symbol of evil.
  IFD 507H.

- Symbol of the burdens imposed on him by man.
  IFD 507H.

The Fire:

- Symbol of annihilation. EMA 226

- Stands for the "evil" in actual life. EFA 215

The Horse:

- Symbol of an emotionally biased judge.

- Symbol of conscience.
  IMB 214S.

- Symbol of pliability.
  IFC 220H, IMB 305H.

- Symbol of commonsense.
  IFB 206H.

- Symbol of mercy.
  IFA 221H. EMA 212, EMA 217

- Symbol of evil.

- Symbol of rationality.
  EMA 217

- Symbol of one who seeks justice.
  IMB 216H, EMA 216, EFA 223, EFA 234

- Symbol of goodness.
  IMA 102S, EMB 241

- Symbol of loyalty.
  IFB 206H, IFA 20 H, IFB 223S, EFA 225

- Symbol of a foolish sort of nobility.
  IMB 203H.
- Symbol of a true friend. EMB 249
- Symbol of a good man. EMB 244

The Fox:

- Symbol of betrayal.
  IMB 222H, IMB 216H, EFA 223

- Symbol of opportunism.
  IFD 307H, IFB 205H, IFA 221H, IFD 504H, IFD 507H, IFD 507H, EMA 201, EFA 203, EMA 216, EMA 217, EFA 225, EMA 227, EFA 233, EFA 234, EMB 240, EMB 244

- Type of Shylock.
  IMC 403S.

- A symbol of cunning.
  IFB 201H, IMC 202S, IMB 203H, IFB 215H, IFB 225S, IFD 230H, IMA 101S, IMA 102S, IFC 220H, IMB 228H, IFB 219H, IMB 213S, IFB 401H, IMB 305H, IFD 307H, IFC 309H, IFB 211S, IMA 210H, IFB 206H, IFA 207H, IFA 221H, IFD 504H, IFD 507H, IFB 301H, IFD 304H, EFA 202, EFA 204, EFA 205, EMA 206, EMA 210, EMA 212, EFA 215, EFA 220, EFA 225, EMB 241, EMB 240, EFB 242, EMB 244, EMB 247, EMB 249, EFB 252

- Stands for an underdog. EFB 246

- Symbolizes the basic stupidity of those who consider themselves cunning.
  IMB 209H, IMA 210H, IFB 223S, IFC 402H, EFA 215, EFA 228, EMB 249, EMB 250

- Symbol of greed.
  IFC 220H, EMA 201, EMA 212

- A symbol for all false witnesses.
  IFA 207H, IFD 504H, IMA 210H, IFB 205H, EFB 253

- A symbol of rationality.
  IFB 201H.

- Symbol of evil.
  IFB 211S, EFA 234

- Symbol of cleverness.
  IFA 207H.

- Symbol of quick-wittedness.
  IFC 218H.

- Symbol of unreliability.
  IMB 204H, EMA 217, EFA 219

- Fox is a hiding animal. As it exposes itself to the sun, it might be a symbol of clarity and beauty.
  IFD 507H.

- Symbol of a meddlesome person. EMA 224
- Symbol of man. EFA 230

The Man:

- Symbol of incompetence.
  IMB 209H.

- It is strange that he should be presented as a symbol of all mankind.

- Symbolized a basicly good but flawed personality.
  IFB 211S, IFC 402H, EMA 201, EMB 240

- Stands for mankind in all its aspects. EFA 203

- In spite of his kind heart, he symbolizes those who exploit the underdogs. EMA 227, EMB 240

IFB 229H, IMC 404H, IFB 206H.

- He symbolizes a basically good person who likes to help others.
  IMB 214S, IFA 207H.

- Symbolizes the best and the most upright i[illegible] man.

- Symbol for a turn-coat. EFA 228

- Symbol of goodness.
  IFB 229H, IMB 214S.

- Symbol of goodness of conscience.
  EFB 252
- Symbol of self-interest.
  IMA 212S, EFB 252

- Symbol of might at its worst.
  EFA 234
- Symbol of cunning.
  IFB 229H, IFD504H

- Symbol of helpfulness.
  IMB 214S.
- Symbol of fickleness. EMA 212, EFB 253

Hens:

- Stand for bribery.
  IMA 103S, EMB 245, EFB 253

The Woman:

- Symbol of opportunism.
  IMB 214S.

The animals and the people in the story symbolize different types of men and different degrees of intelligence.

IFB 206H, IFB 208H, EMA 231, EFA 235

All animals are symbolic.

IMB 233H, IFD 508H, EMA 210, EMA 211, EMA 232, EMB 238, EMB 245, EMB 248 EMB 249, EMB 251,

No symbols in the story.

IMB 226H, IFB 306H, EMB 243

THE UNIVERSAL ELEMENTS

- Everything about the story is universal.
  IMA 103S, IMA 102S, IFB 208H, IFB 306H,
  IMA 214S, IMB 203H, IMC 308H, IMB 209H,
  IFD 401H, IMC 1, EMA 216, EFA 223, EMB 251

- Nothing about the story is universal.
  IMB 213S

- Because the theme is mankind, the story is naturally universal.
  IFC 218H, IMB 217H, IMB 219H, EFA 203

- Because it deals with eternal human problems, it is universal.
  EMA 201, EFA 225, EMB 249.

- A story which would appeal to all people of all classes everywhere in one way or another. Of course the interpretation would vary.
  IFC 309H, IMB 209H, IFB 306H, EFA 218.

- All the symbols are universal. All the characters (who are both extemporal and supernatural) are universal,
  IMA 210H, IFB 223S, IFB 230H, EFA 234, EMB 240

- Each character (human, animal) represents universal clichés.(the horse is loyal, the fox is cunning etc.) (sic) EMA 217.

- Because the characters are like people we meet everywhere in our contemporary society, the story is universal.
  IFD 307H, IFC 309H, IMB 203H, IFB 208H, IMB 214S, EFB 252, EMA 209, EFA 235.

- The exploitation of animals by humankind is universal.
  EMB 250

- Talking animals are universal.
  IFB 229H.

- The animals representing human types is a universal feature. (sic)
  IFB 224S, IMB 216H, EMA 209, EMA 216, EFA 230

- The appearance of a third person narrator at the end is universal.(sic)
  IFB 205H.

- Some Marxist interpretations find the story universal only in terms of a certain economic system.
  IMC 403S, IFB 229H, IMB 217H.

- The problems arising from blind trust is universal.
  EMB 250

- Universal themes:
  - In seeking objectivity, man unconsciously behaves subjectively.
    EMA 222.

  - good and evil
    IFC 309H, IMB 222H, EMA 227, EMB 238, EMB 241, EMB 245.

  - ingratitude EMB 243
  - selfishness EMA 231, EMA 232.
  - fear EFB 253
  - repentance EFB 253
  - ambition EMA 227,
  - betrayal
    IMB 227H, IFD 2, EMA 227, EMB 244
  - justice IMB 227H.
  - double-dealing
    IFD 504H, EFA 203, EMA 213, EFA 219, EFA 233,
  - compassion EMA 231, EMB 244,
  - Self-seekers are doomed to be disappointed.EFA 220,
  - the multiplicity of human behaviour patterns.
    IMB 216H, EMB 248
  - to appeal to various judges when faced with a dilemma.
    IFD 304H, IMB 228H, EFA 202, EMA 231, EMB 248,
  - bribery.
    IFB 211S, IMC 225H, EFA 228, EFB 242, EMB 244, EMB 245
  - going back on one's word.
    IMC 225H, EFA 228
  - the eternalgive and take process
    IMB 305H, IMB 203H, EMB 248
  - mankind's flawed nature: on the one hand compossionate, on the other prone to breaking oaths, and to opportunism under stress.
  - the perrenial conflict of interest.
    IMC 404H, IFB 201H.
  - men do not want to recall their moments of weaknesses which is one of the reasons why they behave badly (sic) towards those who have done them a good turn.
  - the interdependency among groups of people.
    IGB 229H
  - desire to pass judgement.
    IFB 211S
  - revenge
    IFB 211S, EMA 231, EMB 244
  - vengeance EMB 241

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

- evil
  IFB 211S
- The question appears not to have been comprehensible to some.
  EMA 224

STYLE

A- Comments on specific words, phrases and paragraphs:

- p.3 l.11 "catch the ones he must take to the fox" - very poorly expressed in Turkish.
  IFD507H

- p.3 ll.25-26 "it had to run up the hill, so that it was sweating profusely"(ref. to TK) is grammatically wrong and should have been in the historical past and not in the historical future tense.

- Addressing the woman as "karı" is impolite.
  IFC 220H, IMB 2145.

- The use of the historical tense emphasized the fact that the story is a fairy tale. However, in the last sentence the story moves into the simple past tense.
  IFD508H, IMB203H, IMC225H.

- The narrator suddenly comes forth in the last sentence.
  IFC220H.

- Interesting stylistically., but I didn't understand why it was put there. (Ref: the last sentence)
  IFC 402H, IMD 505H, IMB 213S, IFB 306H, IFD 508H.

- The last sentence is grammatically unsound.

- The fox could have expressed itself better in its final words.

B- Presentational and fairy-tale style and the comments made with reference to them:

- Too short for a fairy-tale.

- Ought to be read as a fable.
  IFD 508H, IMC 308H, IMA 210H, IFB 206H, IFC 402H,
  IMC 403S, IFD 504H, IMC 404H, IMB 203H, IFB 224S,
  IMB 217H, IMA 103S, IFB 306H, IFB 230H, EMB 250, EFB 253

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

- Dissapointing ending as far as fairy tales go.
  IFD 507H.

- The language of this fairy tale is not like the language of fairy tales in general.
  IFB 219H.

- In spite of unexpected events, it's coherent.
  IMB 209 H.

- There is a logical sequence to the story. The linking of one unexpected event to the other is superb.
  IFB 205H.

- The chronological order of the events is flawed.
  IFD 507 H.

- There is no logical sequence to the chain of events. It is too fantastic.
  IFD 507H, IFD 401H, IMD 505H.

- Time and place is not indicated.

- There are logical inconsistencies.
  IFD 401H, IMD 505H.

- One episode does not develop from the preceeding one: Eg: The snake first wants to swallow the man but later consents to seek a judge.

- The last sentence has no organic relation to the tale.
  IFC 309H, IFB 206H, IMD 505H.

- The last sentence is unnecessary.
  IMA 212S, IFB 211S, IFB 219H.

- The story has not been developed well.
  IFB 219H, EFA 235

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

- Last sentence distorts the message.
  IFD 504H.

- Last sentence produces an alienation effect.
  IMC 404H, IMB 217H.

- The narrator should have introduced himself at the beginning.
  IMB 214S.

- The appearance of a third person narrator at the end is universal.
  IFB 205H.

- The fact that the narrator presents himself as a witness to the events at the end is strange.
  IFC 402H, IFD 504H, IMA 101S, IMB 214S, EFB 253

- The narrator underlines the message at the end.

C- General Stylistic Comments:

- There is a certain unity.
  IMB 209H, IFD 504H

- An unimaginative story. EFA 202
- The story is too simplistic. EFA 235

- The story has no inner coherence.
  IFB 219H.
- A very complex story. EFA 237

- A logical story.

- The first and the last paragraphs compliment and offset each other.

- It is short, concise and to the point .
  IFC 309H, IFD 508H, IFB 201H, EMA 214, EFA 219

- The narrator rushes the story to its end.
  IFC 218H, IFC 220H, IFB 219H.

- The style is monotonous.
  IMA 212S, IFB 205H, EMA 222

- The style is awful.
  IFD 507H.

- There is artistry in the tale.
  IMC 403S.

- The style is good, it is easy to read and comprehend, it is narrated in simple language.
  IFC 402H, IFB 306H.

- It is narrated in simple language.
  IFB 224S, IFB 306H, EFB 242

- There are no tekerlemes, no internal rhymes in the prose , stylistically too simplistic.
  IFB 219H.

- The repartees are concise, to the point, spontaneous and therefore funny.
  IMB 222H.

- The symbols are good but they have been unnecessarily exaggerated. EMB 249

- The symbols could have been expressed with more clarity.
  IFB 219H.

- The story is an allegory.
  IFD 307H.

- The story is an allegory of various different view points.
  IMC 308H, IMB 222H, IFD 506H.

- By using animal figures, realities on a different plane are expressed.
  IMB 209H, IMB 216H, IMA 103S, IMA 101S, IFD 508H.

- The animals representing human types is a universal feature.(sic)
  IFB 224S, IMB 216H.

- It would have been better, if alongside with the usual fantastic elements, some unusual ones had been dished out.

- It would have been better if the theme of "the impossible" had been centered on "man". EFB 253

D- Over all evaluation of style:

- It seems to be an incomplete tale.
  IFD 507H

- A style which makes one think.
  IMB 209H, EFA 205, EFB 242

- It is a stimulating story.
  IFD 506H, EFA 235, EMB 243

- The obvious theme here is not artistically woven in.
  IFD 401H.

- There is no space for the reader to fill in with his own imagination.
  IMA 210H, IFD 401H.

- A geometrical story.

- Too many things are being symbolized. EFA 215P, EMA 217

- Too many clichés (the reader looks forward to a story with an honest fox, an unexploited ass, and a morally upright snake) EMA 217

- The types displayed and the environment are appealing. EFA 233

- It's not a type that I'm used to. EFB 252

THE GOLD APPLE

THE INDICATORS

"Six daughters":

- Number six is probably mythical. IMC 403H.
- Number six is probably magical.
- Why is the number of children is stated? IFD 40H
- It is common to have many children in villages, but why state the number?
- Why six girls? According to Freud, the motif usually admits of three. IMC 403H.
- An interesting point. IFC 218H.

"Led a tolerably good life":

- Does not explain what the man did for a living. IFC 220H.

"Hello father of six bitches":

- Bitches indicate society's prejudices. IFB 205H.
- Bitches indicate, that they are probably wily. IFD 401H.
- Bitches is slang, why does not the father give an answer? IMB 214S.
- This is regarded as women's natural place in society.
- Why call them bitches? IFD 407H.
- In most parts of the world women are considered useless, worthless beings.
- This is belittling, why call them bitches? IMA 101S.
- Are they such flirts?
- This is a phrase devised by society to humiliate girls. IMA 101S.

- It shows the malevolence of the man who utters it.
- The girls must be innocent.
- The father of six girls is ashamed of having only daughters. IFA 221H.
- Indicative of certain sociological realities. IFD 508H.
- The father of six girls is looked down upon. This should not be so. IMC 1.
- Girls are called bitches. This must be a very conservative country. IMB 232 H.
- I object to this kind of attitude.IMA 101S.
- This is designed to humiliate the father. IFC 402H.

"He began to brood":

- The father of the girls must be a passive figure. IMB 214S, IMC 202S.
- He does not say why do you slander my daughters. IMB 228H, IFA 221H.
- He's is not proud of them.
- He probably expects them to cause some sort of scandal.
- The man does not trust in his daughters. IFB 230H.
- The man would have preferred to have sons instead. IFB 230H.

"And we thought...":

- The eldest daughter would like someone to ask for her hand in marriage.IFB 230H.

"So the man got two things to brood over";

- The man is ashamed because nobody has appealed to him to ask for his daughters' hands. IFD 508H.

- Getting married is important for the older girls. IMB 232H.
- Maybe he doesn't want to part with his daughters. IFC 218H.
- The man grows more troubled because no one asks for his daughters' hands in marriage. IFB 230H.
- He does not know how to get his daughters married off. IFC 218H.
- Thought is not something that one can count. IFD 507H.
- Why is the man silent, always thinking and never saying anything? IMB 232H.
- It is noted here that to have girls married off is a problem.

"Father of six curs":

- This is an insult. IM 103S, IFD 401H.
- A swear word, stands for one who is lead by self-interest. IFD 401H.
- Six 'curs' equalizes six 'bitches'. IFD 507H.
- This man must have sons. IFD 2.
- 'Cur' should not connote manhood. IMB 213S.

"True, mine are curs alright":

- What is the connection between 'being curs' and stealing the gold apple? IFB 211S.

"The Gold Apple":

- If the gold apple is something found in a far away country, how is it possible for those in a small village to know of its existence? IFD 506H.
- It's going to be a contest of cunning. IMA 103S.

- I would have expected a monster or a sorceress to steal this apple. IFD 506H.

"He came home in deep, deep thought":

- The man cannot put the word 'bitches' off his mind. I think he has an inferiority complex.

"Don't worry about that at all, father":

- Here the feeling of inferiority endemic in fathers of girls is being mocked.
- This attitude is part and parcel of the Turkish Society.
- The relationship between the father and the daughter creates sympathy.
- It is not for the girls to give advice to their fathers.
- What is narrated is absurd.
- The man tells his daughters everything he hears at the coffee house. I don't approve of this.

"Mine can pick..yours can pick":

- It is usually the males that act as protagonists. Therefore it is interesting for the youngest daughter to act as the protagonist. IMB 22H.
- It is absurd to return an insult with a challenge. IFB 229H.
- The father of girls is trying to reassert his respectability.(Ottoman Attitute)
- The girl gets involved in order not to let her father down. This competition is not her own. IFB 230H.

"The whole population crowd in...":

- The question of the equality of sexes has now developed into a social problem.(sic) IFD 507H.

"Puts them straight in prison, there they quarrel":

- The justice administered here is absurd. IMB 305H.
- Two people quarrel and both are put into prison, how is it possible for them to walk out of prison? This is not at all explained. IFD 304H.
- The quarrel is a regular street fight.
- Justice administered is arbitrary. IFD 508H.

"Let us go to the authorities":

- Although the dispute is simply between the two men.
- They refer to the authorities for a solution; dependence and trust in the authority of the state. IFB 230H IMB 228H.

"There in the judge's presence":

- How come the judge allows them to fetch (i.e. to steal) the gold apple? IFD 506H.

"They make the girl wear boys' clothes":

- Very Freudian. IMB 227H.
- It underlines the equality of the sexes.IFD 507H.
- This outfit serves to protect the girl from men.(sic) IFB 215H.
- Once the girl puts these clothes on, she assumes a man's role.
- One cannot undertake this sort of a thing (adventure) in a girl's outfit, only two men can compete. IMB 228H.

- If she succeeds, she will not have succeeded as a girl. (sic) IFB 230H, IFB 215H, IFB 206H.
- This is the means for keeping her identity secret. IMB 203H.

"If you harm her, we will punish you" :

- Contradictary statement, aren't they actually competing? IFD 507H.
- The fathers impose restrictions and rules right away. IFB 230H.
- They are expected to be like two men. It is implied that as the law of nature prompts and common sense indicates, "fire and gun powder cannot be put next to one another (a proverb)". IFB 230H.
- The girl is expected to be protected by the boy as the codes of tradition require . IFD 207H.
- This is indicative of men-women relationship.(ideological) IFB 219H.
- The girl is given the task of being a protestor, a social rebel. But she carries out the task dressed as a man. And her chastity is to be protected by the boy. IMB 232H.
- Importance given to honour and virginity. IFB 215H.

"They mount their horses":

- The girl and the boy will probably marry in the end. IFA 221H.

"I must relieve myself":

- Interesting, the girl feels the need to think, the other one does not give himself this opportunity. IFD 507H.

- This is an indication that the girl is cleverer than the boy. IFD 508H.
- This is very entertaining! Now I won't be surprised if this sort of thing appears in the story. IMB 227H.
- What is meant by 'abdest' is not clear. Does the author want to say that she had a crap or that she performed her ablutions? IMA 212S.
- The girl is able to succeed because she performs her ablutions (as a prelude to prayer), and is able to cross the bridge (because God helps those who have faith). Faith and religion ought be precede all (sic). [The reader read into the word 'abdest' its religious meaning, which is not actually stated in the text. The text reads 'abdest yapmak' meaning 'to have a crap' whereas "to perform one's ablutions' is 'abdest almak'.]

"Blindfolds the horse":

- The events that people overestimate and consider dangereous are in fact not so difficult at all.

"The horse crosses the bridge":

- First miracle, but appears to be quite ordinary.

"The girl beckons him to come":

- Since she does not actually explain to him how she was able to cross the bridge, how does she expect him to come over? Maybe this is an indication of her wiliness. This shows her cunning.

"He whips the animal recklessly and kills it":

- Because the girl does not tell the boy how to cross the bridge, she becomes the cause of the horse's death and the boy's final and absolute failure. IFB 230H. IFD 507H.

- It was not worth killing the horse.
- The girl's cleverness has overcome the boy's brutal force and stubbornness. IFB 230H.

"He puts the horse's saddle on his back":

- Interesting, he probably took the saddle home with him to prove to others that his horse was of no use anymore.
- The narrator makes no comment about what the girl thinks of the boy's failure to cross the bridge. Why? IFB 229H. IFD 507H.
- Earlier in the tale when she was relieving herself, we were informed of the girl's thoughts: Why not now? If we were told that "She was happy", it would be giving her away.

"Come on in, my girl":

- How did the old woman realize that Ali Sağdıç was a girl? After all she was dressed as a boy. IMB 227H.

"The girl told the old woman what had happened":

- This adventure was to be a secret. Why does she tell all to the old woman? IMB 232H.

"The old woman gives her...":

- This displays the solidarity among women.
- To encounter this old woman is indicative of her good luck.
- She (the girl) uses other people's previous experiences. The old woman helps the girl. IFB 230H.

"Lap dog":

- It is strange. IFD 507H, IMB 227H.

- It creates an alienation effect.
- One does not expect to encounter a lap dog in a village. IFB 205H.
- It is strange to have a lap dog here, ought to have been a Shepherd dog. IFB 223S, IFB 208H.
- Maybe the narrator wishes to underline the dog's domesticity. IFD 507H.
- This is the kind of dog one frequently finds in villages; it is quite small and senses danger on the spot. IMC 1.
- It stands for the girl's intuition. IFD 304H.
- That is why the old woman probably gives it to the girl. IFD 304 H
- A friend to mankind like all dogs.

"A large sea will appear":

- This may create a sense of eternity in the readers. IFD 507H.
- It has mystical and religious implications. IFD 508H.

"Yeast":

- What the yeast accomplishes is actually brought about by God. IMC 1.
- A myth of Jewish origin (Passover). IMB 232H.

"The large sea divided in two":

- Like passover; Moses had crossed the Red Sea in this way. IMB 228H, IFB 230H, IFB 229H, IMC 202S.
- Second miracle, out of the ordinary. IFD 401H.

"She passed through 'tıngır mıngır'" :

- She passed through easily, without any trouble or care. IFD 507H.

"A guest with the looks of a girl (implied in the eyes)" :

- Reminds one of homosexual desires. IMB 23H, IFB 205H, IFD 507H.
- However, since later on he insistently wishes to see him as a girl, this impression is altered. IFB 205H, IFD 507H.
- Beyoğlu is rather detached from society. IMC 202S.
- He cannot discover her secret and prove that she is a girl. IFB 230H.
- But he falls in love immediately as if he had been waiting for her. IFB 230H.
- What if she does not turn out to be a girl? IFB 230H.
- Why is it that Beyoğlu does not see her and recognize her sexual identity? The old woman had recognized her as such straight away.
- Why does not Beyoğlu take her word but suspect her sexual identity?

"Beyoğlu consulting his mother" :

- The love between mother and son is somewhat like the love between the girl and her father. IMD 505H.
- He consults her at all times.
- He is affectionate but unfortunately he is in need of his mother's assistance (sic).
- Her suggestions are practical and witty. IFB 219H, IFD 508H.

"Rose leaves":

- Beyoğlu's mother, being a woman herself, knows that girls have higher temperatures than boys.
- This seems to indicate that Beyoğlu wishes to go to bed with the girl, but the girl does not get into bed. IMB 227H.
- This motif reminds me of the tale of The Princess and the Pea. IFB 230H.
- Here the sexual desire which is metaphoric is represented as a physical fever; by desire your body is made warmer. IFD 507H.
- Why isn't Beyoğlu satisfied with the test of rose leaves?
- Girls being considered feverish implies that this is a traditional society. IMB 23H, IFB 219H.

"Beyoğlu himself waited":

- He waits on the girl himself. This is considered strange by the reader. IFB 230H, IFC 220H.

"She passed away the time smoking":

- Strange.IFD 506H.
- She wishes to prove to others that she is a boy.IFD 507H.
- This indicates that she has identified herself with the male sex. IMB 229H.
- The girl's sexual identity ought to have been discovered from her appearance. She has breasts. Smoking should not have fooled anyone. IFB 229H.
- She smokes in order to keep awake all through the night not to feel the need to lie down in bed. IMC 1.

- The girl is smoking. What sort of conservative society is this? IMB 232H.
- Strange, this is something done by men (sic), not something appropriate for a girl. IFC 220H.

"He comes coughing and sneezing":
- Why, he is not sick? IMA 212S.

"The maids came and put away her bed":
- Inconsistency; Beyoğlu was said to do all the housework himself (sic); he is the one who put the rose leaves in the girl's bed; how come it is now the maids who tidy up the room. IFD 507H.

"If she is a girl she likes finery...":
- All the counsels that Beyoğlu's mother gives to her son are witty and practical like those that the girl gave to her father.
- The second and the third tests are based on the traditionally accepted beliefs and expectations with reference to girls. They are ideological. IFB 219H.
- Why do they disregard the results of the rose leaves? IFB 211S.

"He inserted it instead of the lost tooth":
- The girl gives herself away, being a woman she pays attention to the way she looks; the fact that she carries a pearl with her in her pocket proves the validity of the third test she is undergoing. IFD 507H.
- This shows that the girl's male identity is superficial. IFB 230H, IFB 229H.
- The pearl seems to be a clue, like the glass shoe in the Cindrella Story (sic). IMC 403S, IFB 230H.

"Take me to the cutlers":

"The girl is trying to prove her manhood by her desire to buy a knife. IFB 230H.

- The clever girl is able to deduce from the previous events that she is being tested and so acts; however except for the reader, nobody in the text marks her cleverness. IFB 230H.
- The girl did not give herself away by being distracted by baubles. She always stuck to her male identity. IMC 1.
- Knives and guns are accepted to be interests of males. IFB 206H.

"They returned to the palace (p.8)":

- It is interesting that even after the incident at the bazaar, which provides an (apparent) proof, Beyoğlu is still not convinced of the male identity of Ali Sağdıç. IFD 401H.

"Going to the baths (hamam)":

- A more absolute test of sexual identity. The mother finds a direct solution to the problem. IFD 507H.

— When social criteria for testing the sexual identity of Ali Sağdıç fail, they have to employ a natural measure, that is to examine her physically. IFB 230H.

- It's interesting that Ali Sağdıç promptly accepts to go to the baths. She is not afraid of beign found out. IFB 229H.
- It looks as if she was ready for such a test. IFD 507H.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

- Beyoğlu is still in love, although the girl has passed al the tests of manhood. A passion for the strange, the unknown. IMB 232H.

"We have offended him":

- He does not realize that Ali Sağdıç has left (ran away). He thinks instead that she has been offended. IFA 221H.

"She wrote a message and left it in the boy's pocket":

- Interesting, it is anachronistic, like the use of the word 'Belediye' (municipal building).
- You'll see, these two will get married.
- Why leave your adress? IMA 212S.

"She sent a message from there to her home district...":

- How come? In those days, what means of communication were there after all?
- She wants to prove herself and to herald her success not just to her father but to the society at large.

"Showed it (the gold apple) briefly":

- She does not show it, but shows it briefly, as if she did not want to flaunt her success in public.

"They spat at the other man's face":

- The problem is no longer a feud between the two men, but a full fledged social issue.IFC 220H, IFD 507H, IFC 220H.
- The man who humiliates another man for having daughters is punished.
- Folk-justice (the spitting incident). IFD 508H.

- A humiliating thing; it was not part of the bargain. IMB 213S.
- The public punishes the father of the boys and rewards both the girl and her father.

"I came as summer, I leave as autumn":

- Summer implies happiness, autumn grief. It also underlines the passage of time.
- In her message, the girl comes right out with the secret Beyoğlu has thirsted to know all along. IFB 230H.
- Here the sexual aspect of the tale becomes apparent. IFB 230H.
- The girl actually likes the man; because she leaves her address, she is flirting with him. IMB 228H, IFA 221H, IFB 230H.
- The girl beats the man and traps him through love. IMB 232H.
- Contradiction: The girl is out to demolish the established view of womanhood and yet she has marriage in mind. IMB 21.
- Autumn implies grief, for the girl has also fallen in love and finds it difficult to leave Beyoğlu.
- I thought the story had come to an end here. IMA t101S.
- She makes her mating call. IFB 230H.
- She fuels the fire in the man's heart.(sic)
- She mocks him saying: "You couldn't get me". IFB 230H.
- A woman with her wiles can always beat a man.(a proverb) IFD 2, IFD 506H.

"He puts his hand in his other pocket, there is no gold apple";

- Beyoğlu does not react at all to the loss of the Gold Apple. Interesting, he had reacted strongly to the dissapearance of the girl.

"Sorceress":

- The wit of Beyoğlu's mother no longer suffices; the sourceress takes her place.
- Supernatural powers start to help Beyoğlu instead of the girl. IFB 230H.
- It shows that people believed in such beings in those days. IMA 103S.
- Love and magic are inevitably related. IMB 232H.

"Turtle doves":

- They carry messages back and forth.
- The girl understands that the doves are sent by Beyoğlu. No one can deceive a clever person. IFD 2.

"A water-jar":

- Witches do not mount water-jars. This is an alien motif to Turkish tales. IMB 203H.
- They usually fly on sheep hides.
- They mount broomsticks. IMA 212S.

"Girls laugh a lot":

- A prejudiced generalization about girls, somewhat like 'girls are feverish'.

"They are exactly like...":

- The girl is very clever and alert. No one deceives her.

- She immediately recognizes the doves. She must have a yearning for Beyoğlu. IMB 227H, IFA 211H.

"Don't you feed both of them...":

- There is a proverb which goes: "The one with a full belly will run out and the one with an empty belly will seek to gain". And so this advice is in line with this proverb. IFD 2.
- The full and the hungry doves stand for the unfair distribution of wealth in a community.
- Indicative of social relations. IFB 219H.
- She had followed all previous instructions, so why does she feed them both on the 41st night? IFD 506H.

"On the forty first night":

- She feeds them both in the hope that they will take her back to Beyoğlu. IFA 221H.
- "Forty" is a traditional number, it can be associated with marriage. IFD 507H.
- "Forty" is a magic number, it is associated with death and birth as well.
- It is a lucky number. IFB 230H.
- It is necessary for forty days to lapse in order for that marriage to take place and for the couple to be happy together. IFB 230H.

"Beyoğlu had prepared priests":

- It shows how he was sure of himself and that the end will be happy. IFD 570H.
- Priests (imams) place the tale in a Moslem setting.
- This is the first indication that the story takes place in a Moslem community.

- The marriage of the girl to Beyoğlu may be identified with her desire to get rich. IFB 215H.
- It was implied that Beyoğlu was after the gold apple, but in the end it is clear that Beyoğlu wanted the girl. IMA 212S.

"Beyoğlu's father opened up a shop":

- It is very interesting, it does not fit in with the image of the palace of Beyoğlu. IFD 506H, IFD 507H.
- Beyoğlu moves downward in the social scale. IFD 507H.
- Why should such a rich man open a shop? IFC 402H, IMB 305H, IMA 212S, IMB 213S, IMB 214S.
- This indicates the values of the bourgeois world. IFD 504H.
- The father should have opened a shop not for his soon but for the father of the girl. IMD 505H, IFB 208H.
- Instead of keeping his son around as a parasite (to live on his father's wealth), the father opens up a shop for him. IMD 505H.
- An incongruous ending: I thought he had a palace. IFD 508H.
- What a middle-class thing to do. IMB 232H.
- A number of readers found it strange that Beyoğlu's father should open up a shop for him. IFC 220H.
- Rubbish, nonsense: Beyoğlu is a rich men. IMB 227H.
- Beyoğlu does not need a shop, so why does his father open one up for him? IMB 228H.

THE "MEANING" OF THE STORY

The Story is About:

- A girl being rewarded for her worth in a male dominated world even though she has to resort to tricks. EFA 203
- Helping the underdog; starts with positive characters, and has a positive point of view. IFC 402H.
- The fact that in this social environment women are expected to get married. The girls' problem is to get married, but they wait passively for it to happen.
- The father-child relationship is being emphasized. EFB 217
- Man's wit is pitted against girl's. The girl beats the man purely by chance.
- The theme of the rich boy and the girl of common stock.
- The harmony between the functioning of nature and of society.
- Quest and conquest. IFC 402H.
- Societies in which girls are considered to be less powerful than men. This story is to be read as a proof that it is not so. IMA 101S.
- That women can have as many rights as men. IFB 224S.
- The importance of women. IMA 102S.
- People, when they reach their goals, are faced with unexpected things and are moved by these so they shape their lives in the direction of these influences. (Sic) IMB 203H.
- A society in which men's importance is asserted.
- The ambiguity of sexual identity. IMB 226H.
- The hidden and overriding courage in women. EFA 218

- Nature putting more obstacles in the girls' way and being more favorably inclined to men.
- A warning to us against underestimating no one. EMA 206 IMB 226H.
- How one suffers in the name of love. EFB 211
- That by exercising his/her wit, and preserving his/her integrity and honesty, one may overcome any difficulty. IFB 206H, EMB 251, EMB 245, EMB 240, EFA 234, EMA 227
- The theme of sexual satisfaction. EFB 246
- It shows the harmonious functioning of nature and society. IFB 230H.
- Sexual discrimination in our society is absurd. The tale proves this point. IFB 208H, EMA 226
- Younger people are more intelligent than their elders. IMC 308H.
- Based on the common theme of the desirability of having sons rather than daughters. IFD 506H.
- Girls and men are equal. A girl can do anything a man does. IFD 2.
- A girl can do anything a man does. IMC 1.
- The theme of testing. IFD 508H.
- Women always win in matters of love. IMB 232H.

The Messages Given are:

- It affords proof that girls are more intelligent than boys, through the story of a father's humiliation on account of his having daugters only. IFD 401H, IMC 403H.
- The differences we observe in human beings arise not out of their sex, but out of their degrees of intelligence. IFA 207H, EMA 225, EMA 212

- The differences we observe in human beings arise not out of their sex. IFB 224S.
- Emphasizes that girls too can achieve things in a society in which sex discrimination is common. IFC 218H, IFD 307H,EMB 245, EMA 226
- It still makes the point that the girl is more able than the boy. IFC 218H,EFA 233
- Girls are more cunning than boys. IMC 403S,EMB 249, EMB 247
- Women like to be won over.
- No matter how difficult a problem looks, it can be solved through dilligence, perseverance, cunning and supernatural aid. IFB 201H.EFB 253, EMB 251, EFA 223, EMA 216
- Fight to the end if you think it is the right cause.
- What will be will be. What is fated will come to pass. (Reader's comments have religious overtones).
- Women overcome difficulties with the help of their innate feminine abilities. IFB 229H.EMB 247
- The one who has confidence in him/herself finds his way and wins at the end.
- If you excercise cunning you'll win. IFB 229H, EFA 221
- Equality between men and women. IMC 225H,EFB 242
- The underdog always win through the use of his wit. IFB 215H.
- The underdog always wants to prove himself. IFD 307H.
- In order to reach a goal, one has to search and work hard. IFB 301H,EMB 250
- Human beings are all equal. IFC 309H.
- The reader quotes a Tk. proverb: an unexpectedly small stone may break your head. IFB 211S,EMA 231P

- Do not press your opinions unless you are absolutely sure that you are right. (The reader presumably sees the story in the context of a wager between the two fathers).
- Those who settle a problem through honest means and without hurting others will eventually win.
- The underdog always ends up as the winner. IFD 401H.
- To reach one's goal, one must desire it passionately.
- What seems like a big problem to one individual may pose no problem to another.
- Intelligence is a more potent force than mere power. EMA 231
- Do not give way to despair! Be patient and there'll be someone to help you out. EMA 232
- Will and wit ennoble mankind. EFB 252, EFA 235
- One who has will power and intelligence wins. IMB 222H.
- Never to discriminate sexes. IFA 207H.
- One can achieve anything through intelligence. IFD 508H, EFA 230
- One must not underestimate and scorn anyone. The least expected person can achieve great things. Sex and gender is no criterion for success. IMB 216H, EFB 253, EMA 209 EMA 206
- There is always a more intelligent person than even the most intelligent. IMB 213S.
- A man who works hard at it and is patient will get his heart's desire. IFD 2, EMB 248, EFA 230
- Wealth and poverty make no difference when it comes to love and marriage. IFD 2.
- One should not lose hope and despair because of his/her physical pecularities like being male/female. IMB 214S.
- If you do not follow the multitude, you will be lost.

The Overall Evaluation:

- A feminist story. IMC 403S, IFD 401H.
- I find it very contemporary. IFD 401H.IFB 246
- Even though it is on the fictional level, the story gives one a certain satisfaction. IFC 402H,EMA 217
- The story sets forth the values which society attributes to men and women respectively. EFB 246
- There is the implication that intelligence is an attribute either solely of men or of women, so that intelligence appears to be in the monopoly of one sex only.
- A basically cruel story which degrades human beings.
- The story is a legend explaining the origin of the name Beyoğlu (a place name in Istanbul). IMA 210H.EFA 221
- Throughout the story there is an ideological point of view regarding society's way of thinking in general. IBF 219H.
- It is a mixture of contemporary and traditional. IFB 219H.
- Not didactic, no lesson at the end. But this is natural in a fairy tale. IFC 220,EFA 223

CHARACTERS

The fathers:

- Well-known folk types who frequent the coofeehouses and who cannot handle their own problems. IFB 230H.

The father of the boys:

- A braggard. IFB 230H.
- A cheeky fellow.

The father of the girls:

- He has an inferiority complex. IFB 230H.

The older daughters:

- Not the type of people who think much.
- She has the right to talk with the father, just because she is the eldest. IFB 230H, IMC 202S.
- They must be old-maids. IMB 232H.
- The eldest is the most clever of the six. IFB 230H.

The youngest girl:

- She is the closest to her father. IFD 507H.
- She is smart. IMC 1.
- She is the most intelligent one, She has the key. IFB 230H, IFD 508H.
- She is ambitious. IMC 202, EFB 253
- She is quick-witted.
- She is a figher.
- She is aware of the society's prejudices. IFC 218H.

- She tries to challange the prejudices of the society, to put an end to it. IFC 218H, IFC 402H.
- She is a non-conformist. IMB 232H.
- She has a complex personality.
- She is the most cherished one. IMD 505H.
- She gives the most valuable advice to her father. IFA 221H.
- She is rather didactic.
- She sees herself on the same status with men. IFD 507H.
- She is cunning. IFA 207H, IFC 220H, IFA 221H.
- She is wily. IFD 507H, IFB 206H, IFB 230H.
- She is clever. IMA 101S, IMB 232H.
- She is like a man. IFB 219H.

The boy: (the one who competes with the girl)

- Brutal and stubborn.
- He is evil natured. IMC 1.
- He is physically weaker than the girl. IMA 102S.
- He has less willpower than the girl. IMA 102S.

The old Woman:

- The old woman helps the girl. Her help is much like the help given by saints, therefore she too is probably a saint herself. IFB 230H, IFD 2.
- She is a white sorceress. IMC 1.

Beyoğlu:

- He is very passive. IMC 202S.

- He is very dumb and naive, a block-head. IFB 230H, IMC 202S.
- He is a good man (he knew it was a girl from the beginning but he did not assault her.) IMC 1.

Beyoğlu's mother:

- A practical and witty woman. She is like the girl in these respects. IFB 230H.

SYMBOLISM

The Apple:

- It symbolizes success. IFB 223S, IFD 307H, IFD 507H, IFB 206H, IFB 224S, IFB 230H, IFD 508H, IFB 229H, IFD 401H.
- It symbolizes conquest. IFD 508H, IFB 230H, IFB 229H, IFD 401H.
- It symbolizes a task to be accomplished. IFB 306H.
- It may stand for social position.
- An ideal or a task that can be accomplished by both sexes.EFA 230
- One of the properties of Beyoğlu. EMA 211
- It can also stand for Eve's apple. IFC 218H, EFB 242
- or Adam's.
- It symbolizes sexual satisfaction.EFB 246
- It is a symbol for difficulties. EMB 241
- A means of reaching Beyoğlu. EMB 250
- It is a symbol for a goal. IMA 103S. EFB 253, EMA 225, EMA 217 EFA 215, EFA 203
- It is a symbol of an aim, and also for the final result. IMB 227H.EMB 240
- It is a representation of Beyoğlu's heart.EMA 217
- It stands for the preciousness of that which is achieved with difficulties. IMB 222H,EMB 251, EFA 218
- It is a means of that which brings together the girl and Beyoğlu. IFD 2.
- It represents something like the Holy Grail at the end of a quest. IFD 506H.
- It stands for something which is almost impossible to achieve. IMB 214S, IFD 506H, IMB 232H, IFA 207H,EMA 227

- A very important thing, a goal perhaps, or a means of asserting one's self. IFB 219H.
- Symbol of power. IMB 222H, IFD 504H, IFC 218H.
- Symbol of knowledge. IFC 218H.
- It is associated with motivation (sic). IMB 203H.
- It is a symbol of will power. IMB 222H.
- Must be a symbol, but of what? IMB 233H.
- Stands for riches. IMB 232H.

The Turtle Doves:

- A symbol for love and affection. IFD 401H, IMB 232H.
- They represent two lovers. IMB 228H. EFB 242
- They are spies or mercenaries.
- They are symbols for human might. EFA 221
- They represent mutual love. IFB 230H, EFA 219
- A symbol for those who reciprocate goodness with goodness.
- Symbol of happiness. IFA 207H, IFC 218H.
- Symbols of peace and stand for the means. IFC 218H.
- Symbol of communication. IMC 404H, IFC 218H.
- Symbol of the subconscious. IMB 203H.
- Symbol of all that is used as a means to reach an end. IMA 103S.

The Rose Leaves

- Symbol of sexuality. IFC 402H.
- Symbol of virginity. IFB 230H, IFC 402H, IFD 507H, IMB 217H.
- Symbol of purity. IMD 505H.

- Symbol of passion. IMD 505H.

The Girl's Father:

- He symbolizes fickleness.

Girls (In General):

- They are humble and courageous. IMC 202S.

Boys:

- They represent braggards. EFB 252, EMA 209

The Youngest Girl:

- She symbolizes all women and we observe all the prejudices of the society related to women directed to her. EMB 249
- She stands for a feminist. EFA 228
- She symbolizes someone who is patient. EMA 224
- She symbolizes reason and goodness. EFA 234, EMA 225, EMA 201, EMA 212
- She represents courage. IMB 214S. EFA 233, EFA 223, EMA 212
- She represents perseverance. EFA 223
- She is a symbol of weakness, of the oppressed segments of the society. IFB 223S. EMA 216
- She symbolizes wit. EFA 233

The Boy (who lost the contest):

- He represents might and power. EMA 216, EMA 201
- He is the symbol for the timid and the coward who acts without consulting his reason, relying instead solely on his masculine insight. EMB 249
- He stands for weak men. EFB 252, EFA 233
- He stands for those who are forced to do things against their will. IMB 214S.

The Elder girls: represent the types who do not think much. EFB 252

Beyoglu:

- He symbolizes goodness.EFA 234, EFA 233
- He symbolizes power and wealth. IFD 508H.
- He is the prize. IMB 213S.
- He is the prize won by the girl.
- He represents intelligence and might.EMA 212, EMA 201
- He is the prince on a white horse. IFB 230H.
- He symbolizes weak men.EMB 249
- He is a symbol of those who are tied to their mothers' apron strings. IMA 210H, EFA 233

Male Outfit of the Girl:

- Symbolic of the differentiation of the sexes. IFB 215H.

The Sorceress:

- This woman is the symbol for human power.EFA 221
- She is the source of supernatural aid. IMC 404H.
- She is the symbol of supernatural power. IFA 221H.

"Fino"(The Lap Dog):

- It is a realistic symbol.
- Symbol of guidance. IMA 102S.
- It symbolizes friendship. IFC 220H, IFC 218H, IMA 102S.
- It is a symbol of magic. IFB 229H,EMB 216
- It is a symbol of loyalty.EFB 207, EFA 221
- It acts like a messenger. IFB 230H.
- A mystical helper. IFD 508H.EMA 217
- Symbolizes intuition. IFD 507H.
- Symbolizes an informer. EMB 241, EMA 227

The Old Woman (Nine):

- She represents a wise person. IMD 505H.
- She symbolizes wisdom.
- Symbol of goodness. IFB 301H.
- She is a symbol of unexpected aid. IFB 301H.
- She is a symbol of luck. EMA 231
- She is a symbol of aid. IFD 304H, IFB 223S. EMA 217, EMA 238
- She symbolizes supernatural power. IFA 222H.
- She is a symbol of the divine matchmaker. IMB 232H.
- Symbol of supernatural aid. IFD 507H.

The Yeast:

- A tool for overcoming all troubles. EFB 253, EMA 227
- It is a sexual symbol. IFD 401H.
- Symbol of power. IMA 102S.
- Fertility symbol.
- It is a guide, a magical symbol and represents good luck, aid and loyalty. EMB 251, EMA 231, EMA 211
- It is something that turns everything into good. IFD 2.

The Saddle:

- The saddle stands for the boy's failure. IFD 507H.

A Large Sea:

- It stands for difficulties one may encounter. IFA 207H. EMB 241, EMA 231, EMA 227

The Pearl:

- The pearl is a symbol of wealth. IMB 228H.
- A symbol of purity. IFA 221H.

The Palace:

- A symbol of wealth. IFD 508H.

The River:

- Stands for parting, a break. IMB 232H.

The Contest Between the Girl and the Boy:

- This is a test for readiness of mind and skillfulness.

The Bridge:

- Stands for a task (an obstacle). IFB 230H, IFC 220H, IFD 507H.EFA 238
- It actually stands for the difficulties one may encounter in life. IFA 205H.EMA 231
- A symbol of success. IMB 305H.
- A phase of life and the events that should be surmounted in this phase of life. IMB 203H.

Crossing the Bridge:

- Stands for an obstacle, overcome by intelligence. EMB 241, EMA 227
- Stands for success in overcoming an obstacle. IFC 220H.EMB 240
- This is the first step. EMB 245

Killing of the Horse:

- The boy symbolically rebels against the system based on competition and in fact subconsciously kills his own father. IMB 228H.

The Mother:

- Symbol of motherhood. (This is unfamiliar in Fairy Tales). IFB 301H.

The Wish to Buy a Knife:

- Stands for penis envy. IMB 227H.

Supernatural Elements: they symbolize the gains which are attained with difficulty. EMB 213

UNIVERSAL ELEMENTS

- The story would be valid for every country, due to the fact that there is no specific time and place mentioned. IMA 210H,EMB 249
- All the characters are universal. IFB 230H.
- Both the style and the content are "strange". IFB 205H.
- The story has a very universal subject matter. IMA 1025,EMB 249
- There are no universal elements in the story. IMB 305H, EFA 233, EMA 216
- It is not a universal but a culturally defined story. IFB 215H.
- The subject matter, the style, the characters and the setting of the tale is close to our culture.

Universal Elements:

- Doves, supernatural events, talking animals and the yeast are universal elements. IMB 228H, IFB 219H.
- Staying overnight at a stranger's house where the means to overcome a difficulty are to be found. IMB 217H.
- The Doves, the gold apple. IMB 232H.
- The parting of the sea into two. IMB 232H, IMB 227H, IMB 228H.
- The woman in disguise and miracles are universal elements. IMB 232H, IMB 227H, IFD 504H.
- The happy ending is a universal element. IMB 217H, IFC 220H, IMB 227H, IFA 221H,EFB 242
- Love is a universal element. IMB 203H, IFD 304H, EFB 253, EMB 241, EMA 231, EFA 228, EMA 227, EFA 221
- Anger, anxiety, suspicion, intelligence are universal elements.EFB 253, EMB 241 EMA 231, EMA 227

- Goodness is a universal element. EFA 234
- Fairy tale elements are universal. IFB 306 H.
- The sorceress is a universal element. IMB 217H, EMB 247
- Religiosity, making ablutions are universal elements. EMB 245
- The gold apple is a universal element. IMB 216H. IFD 401H.
- Turtle doves are universal elements. IMA 103S, IFD 401H.
- The use of magic is a universal element. IFB 230H, IFB 229H, IFA 221H.
- Success and wisdom are universal elements. IFB 206H. EFA 234 EMB 241

Universal Themes:

- Marriage: Two people liking each other and marrying eventually. EMB 240, EMA 217
- It is a very universal theme to have a contest. IMB 227H. EMA 231
- Love of family and homesickness are universal themes. EMA 211
- The themes of enterprising individuals, of going on a journey, and of having many adventures in order to succeed are universal. IFC 218H, IMB 203H.
- The themes of marriage and of being tested are universal. IMC 202S.
- The reader finds the theme of/inequality of/sexes a theme common to all fairy tales. IMB 203H, EFA 228
- To get into a dispute for no particular reason, to get into a bet for no particular reason, and to use one's wit are universal themes. IFB 301H.
- The theme of a male and female uniting, and the theme of "struggle" are universal. IMB 222H.

- The unending struggle between the non-powerful and the powerful. IFD 307H.
- Men-women relationship. IFB 224S, EMB 250, EMB 240
- Love at first sight. IMB 228H.
- A series of adventures leading up to marriage is a universal theme. IMB 227H.
- The theme of youngest girl being successful. IFD 504H, EFA 221
- The theme of the youngest child being the favorite. IMD 505H, EMB 250
- Conflict of two families. IFB 208H, IFD 507H.
- It is universal that the good always wins.

Universal Attitudes and Prejudices:

- The notion of the young man choosing a mate after consulting his mother. IMD 505H.
- There is something universal about the status accorded to women. IMB 217H, EFA 228, EMA 217
- Considering the male and the female sex as seperate parts of humanity is universal. IFC 402H, EFA 228
- Society controls and restricts the relationship between the sexes.
- A young girl who puts her wit and beauty to good use manages to solve the most difficult problems. EMB 251
- The humiliation of women due to the notion that women are inferior to men is a very common theme. IMC 403S, IFC 402H, IFC 309H, EMB 245
- The fact that the women seek out their own mates is universal. IMC 404H.
- Mother's giving practical and witty advice to Beyoğlu, woman's being more clever and cunning than man are universal. IFD 304H.

THE STYLE

Overall Evaluation:

- This is a warm, delightfully light story, the same goes for the style, one is simply carried through the story. IMD 505H.EFB 252, EMB 247
- This is a warm delightfully light story. IFD 401H, IFB 224S.
- The narrative is colourful, interesting. IMD 505H. EFA 235
- This is a delightfully light story. IFB 229H.
- The style is nice and simple, and therefore the story is easy to comprehend. IFC 220H.EMB 245, EFB 242
- All the relevant details are there, a compact story. EMA 209
- Not a compact story. IFB 205H.
- It is a clear story. IFB 206H.
- It lacks clarity. IMB 203H.EMA 227
- It is a very confusing story. EFB 253
- The story has no clear beginning, middle or end. It is simply a chain of episodes put together. No organic unity. IMD 505H.
- The working out of the plot is muddled. EMB 238
- The narrative has a logic of its own, but there is no resolution to the plot. IMD 505H.
- Exaggerated and long. IMA 210H, IMA 103S, IFC 309H.EFA 225, EMA 209
- The story is divided into two parts. IFC 402H, IFD 504H. EMA 216
- No symbolism.EMB 238
- The story sounds like a translated tale to some readers. IMC 403S.

- Romantic (sexual and family relations). IMC 308H.
- In the story the feelings of the characters are not given explicitly, we are not told what they feel. IFD 507H, IFC 402H.
- The gold apple is stolen sooner than I expected. IFD 507H.
- The story should have ended with the baths episode. The ending is not an organic part of the story. IFD 508H.
- "The sorceress" may create a bad impression on children. IFB 301H.
- "It so happened that the man had six boys": The belated information about the fact that the second man has six sons should have been provided earlier. IFD 507H.

Commentary on Phrasing, Wording and Grammar:

- The switch from one tense to another is bad from the point of the language of the text. IMB 216H.
- Some readers are bothered by the transition from the past tense into the simple present tense. IMB 214S, IFC 220H, IFC 309H, EMA 227
- It is narrated in a simplistic language.
- Wrong usage as far as Tk. is concerned, the reader questions its meaning: (Apple V.5, p.6, 1.13 Tk. - stock expression).
- The language is charming.
- The language is weird. It is banal and crude (e.g. "kancık", "abdest" in page 12, "hela", "bitches","to have a crap", and "toilet"). IFB 229H, IFB 201H, IMC 202S, IFC 309H, IMB 203H.

- Colloquial language. IMA 103S, IFD 401H, IMB 203H, IFB 206H, IFD 304H.
- The use of "varmış" is too repetitive. IFC 309H.
- "Kavil" (an archaic word for "fina ".) I don't understand the word. IFD 507H, IFC 220H, IFA 207H, IMB 227H, IMA 212S.
- "Kancık babası": Impolite rendering. IFB 229H.
- "Gayri": In dialect. IFD 507H.
- "Böyle böyle dedi" (Said so and so): faulty grammar. IMB 214S; The narrator does not wish to repeat the same phrase over again, but just says "so and so". IFD 507H.
- "Kız kısmı çok güler". This phrase is grammatically faulty. IMA 212S, IFB 211S.
- "Gülüvermek": This is taken as a pun by one reader. ("gül vermek" is to give a rose, "gülüvermek" to laugh). But the result is ambiguous. IMB 214S.
- "Geçemezmiş": A switch from the present tense to the historical past tense is rather uncommon. Then it switches back again from historical past tense to present tense. IFC 309H, IFD 507H, IFD 304H.
- There are plenty of repetitive sentences. IFB 219H.
- The reader noted that there were many dialect words in the tale which she did not understand. IFC 220H.
- Some readers find the language and style alien to Turkish and find many grammatically faulty sentences. IMC 403H, IMB 214S, IFC 220H, IMA 210H.EMA 211
- "Sağdıç": Does it mean, she is actually cooperating with the boy and that he will not harm her or expect anything from her? (sic). IFD 507H. (The reader made this comment based on the meaning of the word "sağdıç" - i.e. best man at a wedding).
- Characterization of Ali Sağdıç is very good. EFA 233

- "bir de okusa ki" - a strange expression. IFD 507H.
- "cincik boncuk" is wrong - it should have been "incik boncuk". IMB 214S, IFC 220H.
- The language of the text is not fluent.
- "ıldır": it is an obsolete/local usage. Some readers find it meaningless. IFD 401H, IMB 203H, IMB 213S, IMB 214S.
- Many readers wondered about the choice of the water jar in lieu of a broomstick. IMB 214S, IFD 507H.
- A water jar should not produce a sound 'vızz'. IMB 214S, IFD 507H, IMA 101S, IMB 203H.
- In Turkish, the expression "küplere binmek" (to ride on water jars) means that the speaker is extremely angry (sic). IFC 220H, IFC 230H.
- "abdest" (to have a crap) - It has been received with amusement and wonder. IMC 202S, IFC 402H.
- The name "Beyoğlu" reminds some readers (especially those who live in Istanbul) of a district of Istanbul. IFC 220H, IFB 211S, IMB 203H.

Fairy Tale Qualities:

- There are many readers who do not like The Gold Apple because it is a fairy tale. EMB 251, EMB 249, EMA 229
- Some readers dislike this story because it is not much different from other fairy tales. EFA 230, EFA 228
- Some find it too juvenile - a fairy tale too fantastic even for children. IFD 305H, IMA 101S, IMC 308H, IFB 224S, IFB 301H, IFD 307H, EMB 250, EMB 241, EMB 238
- Some dislike it because it is not true to life. IMC 403S, EMA 232

- I liked the way it intermingles the realistic and fantastic elements. IFB 219H. EMA 217
- The intrusion of many fantastic elements indicates that it is fairy tale and therefore not a story.
- Like a myth, an epic story. EFB 252
- It is anachronistic, no time sequence is observed. IFB 206H, IMB 203H.
- Symbols are elements which help us to perceive the truths (behind the stories). EMA 226
- It leads man to dream and therefore makes men more passive. EMA 232
- There are elements from everyday reality (e.g. Apple V.5, p.12, 1.13 opened/bought a shop). IFB 306H. EFA 202
- This takes the reader from the imaginary world to the real one. EFA 202
- Why the frequent use of number 6? IMC 403S, IMB 228H.
- Repetition of questions.
- Personification of the dog: All the fantastic elements in the story side with the girl.
- Stylistically speaking, "derya" (large sea) and the lap dog, make a strange combination. IFD 507H.
- "Derya" and "palace" are typically emphasized in fairy tales. IFD 507H.
- "tıngırmıngır geçme" (cross the large sea slowly) and "Beyoğlu'nun kapının önünde gezinmesi" (Beyoğlu strolling in front of the door): Here the realistic and the surrealistic elements stand together (sic). IFD 507H.
- To have "a pearl in the pocket", "the large sea" and "a palace" side by side with the "Town Hall/Municipality" is rather anachronistic and gives the tale realistic connotations. IFC 220H, IMB 214S, IFD 507H, IMB 226H.

- It is nerve wrecking to have the mixture of realistic and surrealistic elements. IFD 507H. IFC 402H.
- It is rather good that the old and the new are intermingled, there are forward and backward movements in the story. IFD 306H, EFA 202
- Girl's return journey - The speed of the narrative is very important here, only the essential parts are given.
- Fantastic elements are part of fairy-tale style. IMB 305H, EFA 218
- The fact that the lap dog understands human speech is greeted by some readers as fantastic and surreal. IFD 401, IMD 505H.
- The most familiar type of a fairy tale. IFA 207H.
- Supernatural events: inserting a pearl in place of a tooth, doves, sorceress, yeast, lap dog. IFB 219H, IFB 215H.
- The end of the story (working for a living) is too realistic for a fairy tale. IMB 305H, EFA 202
- The fact that the youngest daughter is the cleverest of all is a fairy tale element. IMC 403S.
- The reader finds the structure of the fairy tale foreign. IMB 203H.
- A few readers make a distinction between a 'story' and a 'fairy tale' and says that it is not clear which genre this narrative belongs to. IMB 203H, EFA 250
- Typical fairy tale with lots of imaginary features (sic). IMB 203H, EMB 250

- "Bir varmış, bir yokmuş" (once upon a time), "she threw part of the yeast into the water", "the large sea divided into two" are all parts of fairy tale features (fantastic) and style. IMA 101S, IMA 103S.
- "They make the girl wear boy's clothes", "the dog happened to know human speech", "forty days", the fact that the doves speak are all fantastic elements. IMC 403S.
- Mounting a water jar is a fantastic element. It appeals to the reader's imagination. IMA 103S.
- There are a great many supernatural elements which function as supernatural aid extended to the heroine. IFC 402H.
- "Sorceress", a fairy tale element. IFB 223S,EFA 204

Naturalistic (Representational) Style:

- It is narrated in a very logical fashion. IFB 206H.
- There are no formulaic phrases.
- Language is simple but queer. IMB 222H.

PER SMED'S WHIP

INDICATORS

"Per Smed's Whip"- the whip in the title is significant, it denotes the magical whip. IFD 503H.

"Per Smed was a widower" - The term widower is not usually applied to men.

"...got himself a very beautiful young wife":

- Why did the woman marry Per? IFA 221H.
- It is obvious that the woman's choice (wish) is not taken into account here. Under these conditions what Per does may be evil. EFA 231
- She in seen as an object in society. IMC 225H.
- He should not have married a young woman. IFD 2.
- I don't approve of this marriage. IFB 208H.
- A problem is going to arise from such a situation. IFB 230H, IFC 303H, IFA 207H.

"...for that would be a pity/sin":

- How is it that it is not a sin to rid him of life but a sin to murder him?

"She did not mind that":

- Maybe Per is not able to satisfy his wife. IFB 230H.
- As a person she does not have any problems with him. IFB 230H.
- She has sexual problems with him. IFB 230H.

- The old man and the young wife are not happy.IMD 505H.

"...to rid him of life in a decent way";

- How is it possible to rid him of life without murdering him? IMC 404H, IFD 507H.
- I guess it is mercy-killing. IFA 221H.
- I guess it is mercy-killing, or it is a sin to kill according to religion.
- A contradiction; how come "to rid him of life decently" is not a sin, but murdering him is? IFD 507H.
- Their intrigue is both a plan to get rid of Per and also a challenge. IFD 507H.
- Actually there is no difference between murdering him and getting rid of him in a decent way. IMA 210H, IMB 227H.

"His salvation was in running away":

- He prefers to run away from work that is outside his life experience. IFD 507H.
- In cases of failure people either give up what they are doing or find ways of getting around it.
- Per runs away from difficulties and risks losing his wife. IMB 232H.
- The man has no will-power. IFB 230H, IMB 232H.
- He runs away from direct action. IMB 232H.
- The reverse (the alternative) of killing the man is to force him to run away.
- What the steward invented as a condition is a puzzle. IFB 230H.
- Per is not devoted to life, he does not question. IFB 230H.

- How does he trust his wife and go away?
- It is interesting that he goes away alone and leaves his wife behind, IMD 501S.
- He doesn't exchange his life with money (sic). He doesn't risk his life. IFA 207H.
- The man is passive and a coward, he runs away. IFA 221H.

"...running through the wood":

- Per, the good man, runs through the wood, the "greening", "sprouting" of Per Smed (almost endowed with life). IFD 504H.

The old woman's help:

- Solidarity between old people.

"...if he gave her three akçe":

- One should not give help expecting return but I guess it is all right to get one's wages for a thing done. IFD 2.
- If she has supernatural powers, she is not in need of money. IMB 228H.
- Per is a passive man. He does nothing on his own. IFB 230H.
- She is the symbol of justice so how come she takes three akçe? IMB 232H.
- The old woman does not aid him for free, without a compensation. IFA 221H.

"Per Smed had something to do with cins":

- The steward is superstitious. IMC 202S.
- The steward is superstitious, he believes that cins help Per.

"He runs away from his wife one more time":

- The job here is even more difficult. I guess the woman tells the steward the things that Per cannot do. IFA 221H.
- He has not even learnt to plant trees.
- He doesn't try to learn how to do things. IFB 230H.

"...a very dense frosty mist":

- Interesting, why?

"...a task which he could never accomplish":

- The tasks set to Per are getting to be progressively more difficult. IFB 205H.

The wood, mist and the swamp: As if beauty and ugliness co - exist. IMB 228H.

He was afraid of not meeting the old woman :

- Per is getting to be progressively more dependent on the old woman. IMB 232H, IFB 230H.
- She acts as a consultant. IFB 230H.
- She is happy to see Per, because she will get money.
- Per depends on divine power and trusts in it.
- During the third meeting the woman gives Per power (i.e. the whip) and a more active role. IFD 507H, IFB 205H.
- The old woman helps the old man but not with cunning. IFD 504H.

- She may be endowing Per with sexual power, he forms a relationship with her and then is able to go to bed with his wife.
- She helps those who are in need. It leads me to guess that the complicity of the woman and the steward will be out. IFC 302H.
- Per is too naive, he never questions the validity of the threats. IFC 218H.

"Gave up hoping...for ridding him of life in a decent way":

- Now it is impossible to get rid of Per decently. Per must be killed. IMB 228H.
- Now it is impossible to get rid of Per decently. They'll probably kill Per. IFA 221H.
- This now becomes legitimate. IMB 228H.

"Himphamp":

- It is something that does not exist. IFD 507H.
- The old woman knows of this but Per does not. IFD 507H.
- I liked it. IFD 504H.
- Evil, cunning and conspiraicies are objectified in the form of a himphamp and degraded as such. IFD 504H.
- It appears to be the old woman's asistant.
- This task is different from the other two. IFD 507H.
- This task is different from the other two in that the first two things (jobs) are such that he can understand, the last is incomprehensible-hence, a move from rational to irrational. IFD 506H.
- When Per surpasses him, the steward loses. IFD 506H.
- It is alien to us. IFC 303H.
- It must be something entertairning. IMA 103S.

"...he could get 900 gold coins":

- Each time, the steward triples the amount of money. IFC 302H.
- The relations are based on money. IFB 229H.
- The relations are based on money. This is alien to our culture. IFC 302H.
- This is indicative of the fact that the relationships within the upper class are all in terms of money.
- Still he is indifferent. IFB 302H.

Per is afraid of not meeting the old woman again:

- He is now a fullfledged opportunist. IFD 507H.

"Behind all those.....:

- Even after the old woman tells Per the truth (about his wife and the steward) he remains passive and calmly listens to her advice. IFA 221H.
- The old woman knew all along what was going on. Why does she refrain from bringing it out into the open until the third meeting? IFC 302H.
- It is interesting that she asks for three akçe each time IMB 227H.

"Is it you Per dear":

- The woman feigns concern when she sees her husband.
- It is strange.
- It is not possible for the woman to want her husband to get into bed because the steward is already there. IMA 212S.

The steward and the woman in bed:

- The woman is acting in line with her typical role of a deceiving wife. IFC 302H.
- Because the steward is now certain that Per will not return, he gets into bed with the woman. IMB 228H.
- Does the woman want Per to get killed? IFD 506H.
- The theme of killing is rather suppressed. IFD 506H.
- The wife plans to betray her husband but the old woman prevents her from doing so. IFB 306H.

"The woman has to relieve herself":

- The woman has to relieve herself? IFC 402H.
- Why should she want to relieve herself? IFB 211S.
- How can she relieve herself while lying in bed? IMC 404H.

"The maid was completely naked":

- The maid was completely naked. Interesting! IFD 508H, IFD 507H.
- The maid was completely naked. Interesting, why? Don't they wear underwear or nightgowns when thy go to bed? IFD 507H, IFC 218H.
- Strange, it is the first time that we are told of the existence of a maid in the house. IMA 212S.
- It is unnecessary to have the maid in the tale. IMB 213S.
- It is strange that the maid should get involved in this affair; all the rest form pairs; she is alone and is not the member of any pair. IFD 507H.

"She gives her a box on the face":

- It is ludicrous that the maid should smack the woman. IFB 211S, IFB 229H.
- The maid is like the cheeky and wayward maids in the Restoration comedies.
- a strange form of humiliation. IFD 507H.

Per using the whip:

- It gives Per a feeling of security. IFD 507H, IFA 221H.
- It gives Per a feeling of power. IFA 221H.
- It is like the doomsday: Everyone starts practising all the evil things they can think of, things which are forbidden by religion. IMB 232H.
- Why does Per beat the maid?
- It is a sadistic kind of punishment.
- The whip is Per's assistant.
- Because it can inflict pain, it (whip) can symbolize sadistic emotions, but here Per does not hit but touch. EFA 202
- This is symbolic, but a different kind of instrument would have been more proper in place of this one.
- Per doesn't deserve to use the whip. IFD 507H.
- Per feels that he has mastery over the whip. IMB 305H.

The Pot:

- The toilet should have been outside of the house. IFC 303H, IFC 302H.
- Why is the pot next to the bed? The toilet should have been outside of the house. This is alien to our culture. IFC 302H.

- All those who are guilty are gathered around a pot.
- Squatting on the pot has nothing to do with the theme.
- They are all punished by the pot. IFC 302H.

"Per gave all of them a sound beating":

- Why?
- The maid did not do anything wrong. Why should she be punished? IMB 228H.
- They are all beaten gratuitously, they could have easily got rid of Per.
- He has punished them for the sin of adultery. IFC 302H.
- He didn't have to go through so much trouble in order to beat them all up. IMA 210H.
- Why is the maid glued to the himphamp? IFB 215H.

"He chased all three of them out of the house":

- Per now feels himself powerful, he becomes more independent.
- This was not included in the advice of the old woman. IFD 507H.
- This makes the event public.
- A trio of sinners. IMB 232H.

"The maid grabbed a handful of grass... The old cow... The bull jumped on the cow":

- This is a very poor image.
- It is too exaggerated.
- These signify taboos.

- Per associates the whip with sexual desire and uses it as an instrument (sic). He uses it to stop the bull from assaulting the cow. IMB 305H.
- All these are very arresting, they belittle sexual passion. IFC 302H.
- All this objectifies the grotesqueness of the sexual relationship between the wife and the steward. IFD 507H
- Why is the cow being punished? IFC 302H.
- Per gets angry at the copulation of the bull and the cow. IFA 207H, IFC 302H.
- Per must be impotent or else why should he get angry at the copulation of the bull and the cow. IFC 302H.

Per including everyone into the himphamp:

- This displays Per's sadism.

The squire:

- Why is he also glued onto the others? IFD 506H, IFC 302H, IFD 507H.
- He was no party to the events. IFD 507H.
- He is innocent IFB 229H.
- Why are he and his wife punished? IFC 302H.
- Per wishes to take vengeance on the squire because he forms a team with the steward. IFA 221H.
- Maybe Per wishes to take vengeance on the squire because he thinks the squire is in league with the steward but Per reconciles with him. IFC 302H.
- It may be that the squire was included in this group so that Per could have him do what he wanted to be done (to punish the steward). IFD 506H.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

- He accepts all conditions in order to save himself. IFC 303H.
- If this is a folk tale, the reason why the squire and his wife are put in a ridiculous situation is that the people (folk) want to see them in a ridiculous predicament. IFB 215H.

"Can you take this himphamp to pieces for me?":

- Logical inconsistency - the squire was ignorant of all this; how is it that now he seems to know what is going on? IFB 253

"Yes, on two conditions":

- It is only the steward who is punished. IFB 230H.
- It is only the steward who is punished harshly. IFB 215H.
- The steward is the underdog.
- Once the steward leaves, the status quo is once again established. IFC 303H.
- Once the steward leaves, the evil is also absolved. IFB 230H.
- The expulsion of the steward from the society reminds one of the expulsion from the Garden of Eden. IFB 230H.
- The guilt of the two pollutes them all.

"The Steward...sets the men to work" - a logical inconsistency. Why does the steward still set the men to work after he has been sacked by the squire? IMB 213S, IMA 212S"

"...and Per Smed had his wife to himself and they got along very well":

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

- Interesting, it turns out that the only one who is punished is the steward. IFD 507H.
- Absurd, because she neither repents nor begins to see new virtues in her husband. IMD 505H.
- The steward is accused in order to protect the institution of marriage. IFB 205.
- Why isn't the woman accused? IFB 230H, EMA 209
- Per receives all the money. IFB 230H.
- Why is Per rewarded? IFD 507H.
- Per's success arises purely from chance or good luck; he doesn't have to exert himself or to use his head. IFB 215H.
- It seems that when the squire so wishes, the woman and the old man can get along very well.
- Per does not blame his wife at all. IFB 230H, IFA 221H.
- It is interesting and alien to our culture that he takes his wife back after her betrayal. IFC 302H, IMD 502H.
- The whole problem is solved once the steward leaves. It looks as if the only culprit (wrong doer) is the steward. IFA 221H.
- The fact that the wife is not punished is alien to our culture. IMD 502H.
- He can no longer get along with his wife.
- He must have been senile.
- The problem is solved through Per's initiative, not just with the help of supernatural elements. IFB 219H.
- The evil plans set against Per are defeated through her own exertions and initiative. IFB 219H.

- Why wasn't the steward killed? IFD 506H.
- Per should not have taken her back. IFA 207H, IMA 210H, IFD 2, IMB 212S, IMB 216H, IMB 209H, IFD 504H.
- I don't approve of this. IMB 212S, IMB 216H, IMB 209H.
- Per shouldn't have taken her back, he should have survived on his own. IFD 504H.
- Why isn't the woman punished since she is the steward's accomplice? IFB 215H, EFA 203, EMA 209
- How can a man live with a wife who interded to murder him? EMA 209
- No poetic justice. EMA 209
- The woman will not remain with him. IFD 2.
- How can Per be happy with a woman who doesn't love him? IFB 215H.
- The woman and Per are united by the intervertion of the squire. IMC 225H.
- Innocent Per finally punishes all those who had set traps for him with the help of the old woman. IFA 207H.
- Illogical ending: wife should have been punished slightly as well. IFB 223H.
- Maybe Per has proved that he now has power. IFC 303H.
- The tale displays everyone, except Per, in grotesque fashion. IFD 506H.

THE MEANING OF THE STORY

A- Overall Evaluation

- It is meaningless (sic). EMA 216, EMA 213, EFB 247, EFA 233 EFA 207.
- There is no meaning. IMB 213S, IMB 209H, IFB 211S, IFC 309H, IMB 204H, IMB 214S, EMB 250, EMB 244, EFA 233, EFA233
- Doesn't give the reader anything. IMB 214S.
- A strange, muddled message. IFC 402H,EFA 203, EMA 214, EFB 242, EFA 235.
- A strange, muddled message. Per is not in the right. I wonder why he is rewarded in the end. IFD 507H.
- The meaning is not very clear. The available resources should be exploited in the most efficient manner in overcoming difficulties. IFB 223S.
- Though the story treats universal themes like the problem of wealth, cunning, vengeance, sin, egoism, mortal threats, I didn't get the point, the meaning of the story. EMA 214.
- There is a contradiction in the message given:Per's wife eventually finds happiness though she is evil. Yet in general, the evil ones are punished. EFA 202
- The story carries religious overtones. IFB 230H.
- The story has no inner logic. The innocent ones are also glued to the himphamp like the maid and the cow. IMD 505H. EMA 214
- The story appears to mock the hidden emotions and desires of men.
- An overpowering yet suppressed fear of death dominates the story. IFD 506H.
- The ending is all wrong. IFD 504H, IFB 224S, EMB 241, EFA 230, EMA 227.

- Per should have survived on his own, without aid. IFD 507H.
- I don't like the ending. IMB 204H, EFA 202.
- How can they live happily ever after, after all those deceptions? IFB 224S.
- Perhaps simply written to annoy tne reader. IMB 222H.
- The ending is interesting and just. A person should forgive the one he loves. In this story men and women are treated as equals. In our culture only a man could have been taken back after a betrayal. Good, I like the ending. IFC 302H.
- An obscure ending, but it will make the reader use his imagination. IFD 503H.
- An unexpected ending. Tne evil doer is not punished. I did not get the point. IMB 222H, IFB 223S.
- If we assume that a fairy tale has a didactic element, this tale, with such a wrong ending, cannot possibly teach a lesson. IFB 224S.
- The woman is the loser. She cannot have sex with the man she desires. IMB 222H.
- The woman ought to have been punished as well. IFD 504H, EMA 212, EFA 230.
- A mediocre story of well known clichés: evil is always defeated and the good always conquers.
- The fairy tale appears not to be a contest of skillfulness but a contest of intelligence. IFD 506H.
- The whole story seems to be one of a grand pairing and copulation. IFD 504H.
- The story is sprinkled with the theme of nakedness. (sic) IFB 206H.

- This cannot possibly be a fairy tale. A child who doesn't yet know of intercourse, nakedness, betrayal cannot be allowed to read this. And it is too absurd for an adult reader. I don't like the story. IFB 301H.
- The story starts out seriously. The subject, adultery, is serious. Then it gets progressively more nonsensical. IFC 309H.
- The fact that Per leaves his wife and escapes, and then is praised at the end is contradictory. EMA 214.
- The story doesn't give the message of the eventual success of good against evil properly: The good doesn't work on its own but succeedes by outside help. IMA 227

B- THE MESSAGES CONVEYED

- The story emphasizes sexuality (unlike the other stories) - like adultery, the naked man, the bull in heat, ect. IFB 219H, IMC 403S.

- Sexuality and lack of control over the sexual impulse is a problem of this mortal world. IFB 230H.

- Man is set on the crooked path by temptation. IFB 230H.

- It's continence, lack of ambition and an unquestioning state of mind that win in the end.

- The dilemma of men driven by circumstances.

- It is not so easy to get your way if by exploiting your social position, you lust after a poor man's wife and inflict pain upon the man in the process. IMD 505H.

- Attaining happiness through supernatural means.

- The story depicts in the main precapitalistic relationships.

- The story indicates that sexuality is a pleasurable thing. IMB 226H.

- A tale of fate working itself out.

- The moral is that people shculd not practice what is not sanctioned by common morality. IMD 501S.

- Nothing can be taken by force. EMA 201.

- Nothing can be achieved easily. IFC 402H.

- One (Per Smed) who can not solve his own problem seeks the help of others. EFA 202.

- There is always someone to offer help to the good people. EMA 206.

- The story of a man who evertually sees the truth (though with the help of others) and is able to protect himself from evil doing. EMB 247.

- Help is given to those who are weak and helpless. EFA 221, EMB 247, EMA 211, EFA 207.

- One cannot solve problems by running away from them. IFC 218H, EFA 219.

- To overcome difficulties one must face them squarely. EFA 219

- One must have trust in oneself. IFC 218H.

- It is about human weaknesses and fears: The old man is at first scared of them, then they are all scared of him. IFC 303H.

- That everything depends on conflict of interest. IMB 203H, EFA 223.

- That the class of oppressors isn't interested in anything but money. IMB 203H.

- Shows that people are capable of doing anything in the pursuit of self-interest. IFA 202.

- The fact that, in the society (depicted in this story), relations based on self-interest are in the fore front. People don't have any social awareness. The story exhibits the selfishness of man.

- That a person in a helpless situation tries to escape and grabs at the slightest hope of relief, he then seeks vengeance. EFA 202. (sic)

- That a person under pressure, because of his own weaknesses, instead of relying on himself, chooses to look for a solution in the assistence of others. EFA 232.

- When faced with a problem, one should deal with it and find a way out. IMD 502H, EFA 203.

- You can not achieve your purpose through brutal means.

- At any moment, things may turn out right. EFA 220

- Might wins out. EFA 208

- Shows how we can fight against ambitious individuals by exploiting this very flaw in their character to our advantage. EMB 251

- Question of loyalty versus betrayal. EMA 229.

- It portrays the resistance of an old, established social structure to the new. EFB 246.

- The new (social structure) can defeat and supercede the old only through radical means. EFB 246

- Per's victory shows that disorganized and shallow efforts are doomed to fail against the old, established order. EFB 246

- A quest for sexual power on the part of an old and probably impotent man. Very likely a story written by an old man. EMB 244.

- Everything is possible. IMA 210H.

- People should always struggle to overcome difficulties. IMD 502H.

- A person may be betrayed even by ~~those~~ closest to him IFB 30H.

- The fact that those deeds that are bad and evil are still done in secretive and illegal ways is/being displayed. (sic) EFA 218.

- Here the impossible is achieved through magic. IMD 203H.

- The implication is that a good person can achieve what looks impossible even without the aid of magic. IMB 203H.

- By the inclusion of the old woman in the story, it is indicated that those who find themselves in difficulty will be offered aid. EFA 204.

- The hierarchical structure we see in the form parallels that of society at large.

- It's the tale of a shallow union (i.e. marriage).

- It's about problems arising out of the union of a young woman and an old man. IFD 2, EMA 210.

- Man and wife must be loyal to one another . IFD 2.

- The family is absolute. IMC 404H.

- The story protects the family institution.(sic) IMC 404H.

- A story of how the marriage institution is corrupted. IFB 208H.

- With a few exceptions, it (the family institution) will always be upheld. IMC 403S.

- With a few exceptions, it (the family institution) will always be upheld by the supennatural powers. IMB 305H.

- The union of an old man and a young woman has its drawbacks, but in the end things will work out. IMC 404H, IFD 503H.

- Old men should not marry young wives. IFC 402H, IFD 2, IFC 302H.

- It is about the institution of marriage. IFD 2, IFB IFB 205H.

- It is about the problems arising out of adultery. IFD 2, IFB 205H, IFB 224S.

- It is about the breaking up of a home. IFD 2.

- Deals with as aspect of morality having to do with the matrimonial relationship. IMC 308H.

- It is about the problem of adultery being punished. IMA 212S, IMB 217H.

- The evil doer will bear his punishment. IFA 221H, IFB 306H, IFD 2, IFC 302H, IFD 504H, IMC 202S, EFA 203, EMA 222, EMA 217, EMA 212, EMB 241.

- The evil doer will reap what he sows. IMB 214S, EFA 231.

- Evil will be punished. IMC 308H, IFB 215H, EFB 243, EMB 243.

- It is sinful to lust after another's wife and it will be punished. IMD 505H.

- Evil intentions will be suppressed either by the person himself or by the forces outside him. IMB 226H.

- Betrayal (versus loyalty) will be punished. EMA 229.

- One shouldn't use foul means to reach his ends. EMA 227.

- Those who are ambitious and who set traps for others will eventually be punished. EMA 224.

- Justice will prevail. IMB 231H, IFB 236H, IFB 201H, EMB 248 EMA 210.

- Evil will out. IMD 501S, EMB 243.

- The good will prevail. IFD 503H, IMB 203H, EFA 220, EMA 217, EMA 227H.

- No matter how well evil intentions are masked, they will in the end be rendered ineffectual by those who are smart. IFB 219H.

- The one who sets traps for others will fall into his own trap. IFD 506H.

- Evil plans will be punished by others' evil plans. EMA 214.

- The righteous will always be assisted by a spiritual force. EFB 252.

- The good will always achieve their goal. IFB 205H, IFC 302H, EFA 234.

- It is not right to inflict wrong upon others. EFA 204.

- We can overcome evil only through the help of a powerful ally. EMB 238.

- Those who challange evil are not alone in their struggle. EMA 211, EMA 209.

- It is sinful to covet what others possess. EMB 245

- It is a stark portrayal of the consequences of evil and sinful actions wilfully committed. EFA 225

- The worst sin is to deceive others.

- A good man, because of his goodness, can seek and find help when faced with a difficulty. EFA 230

- It is about good and evil, vengeance and forgiveness and a tendency to act without reflection which coexist in all men. EFA 228

- The good man also leads his wife to the right way. IFC 302H.

CHARACTERS

PER SMED

- not enterprising. IFD 507H, IFB 230H.
- Oppurtunist; he both runs away and takes the money. IFD 507H.
- He is passive. IFD 507H.
- He is insatiable. IMC 202S.
- tolerant.
- naive.
- He is the kind of person whose position is threatened by those who wish to take his place. In this sense he represents those who are under constant threat and tension.
- He is an honest man.
- He is guileless. IFD 508H.
- He is sadistic. IMC 202S.
- He is impotent, lacks sexual vitality. He seems to have resigned himself to his condition. IFB 230H.
- He is uninvolved. IFB 230H.
- He lacks ambition. IFB 230H.
- He is an egoist because he marries a young woman. IFD 503H.

The WIFE

- one who wants a young husband but does not wish to see her husband dead (conscience). IFB 229H.

- She is an impressionable type of a person, susceptible to all influence. EFA 230, EFA 228
- One who gives in to evil.
- She is one of the conspirators, but she is soft because of her gender. IFD 503H.
- She is pious. IMC 202S.

THE STEWARD

- He is self-centered. IMC 225H.
- He only wishes to possess the woman.
- He is the kind of person who has an eye on the possessions of others (covetous).
- He does not wish to kill Per and that's why he exerts himself to find some means of getting him out of the way.
- It is interesting that he is the evil-doer rather than the feudal squire.
- He is a trickster. IFD 2.
- He is superstitious. IMC 202S.

THE OLD WOMAN

- She could be God or a saint. IFD 2, IFB 306H, EMA 213
- She is superstitious.
- She is a materialist. IFB 230H, IMA 210H.
- She is an opportunist. IMC 202S.
- She is a trickster. IFC 218H.

RELATIONSHIPS

- There are no emotional relationships between the characters. IMC 225H.
- The steward and the wife are innocent.
- In the sexual relationship between the steward and the woman, the grotesqueness of sex is exposed in its entirety and in concrete terms. IFD 507H.
- Per and his wife:
  - Their marriage is founded on selfish ends. IMC 225H.
  - It has no sanctity. IMC 225H.
  - It's contradictory that they should be united at the end. IMD 502H.
- Per and the Old Woman:
  - Per buys the old Woman's help with money. IFD 507H.

SYMBOLS

- There is no symbolism. IFC 309H, IMB 214S, IFB 219H, IFB 208H, IFB 211S, EMA 217, EMA 216, EMB 248, EFA 235, EFA 208
- There is no symbolism, instead we have various masks worn by evil. IFB 219H.
- I don't see what the supernatural elements symbolize. IFB 219H.
- The symbolism is ritualistic and culture specific. IFD 506H.

PER SMED

- The struggle of the woman and the steward to rid themselves of Per is a symbol of foundationless revolutionary struggle. EFB 246
- In the role of the husband, he symbolizes religious pressure.
- Symbol of stupidity. EFA 233
- Symbol of goodness. IFB 229H. EMA 201, EMA 212, EFA 234, EFA 225, EMA 206
- Symbol of one who is rewarded on account of his good nature. EFA 230
- The underdog.
- Symbol of cowardice. IFB 301H. EMB 241
- Symbol of one who lacks the will to fight. EMB 206
- One who draws back when faced with danger. EMA 227
- Symbol of the traditional social forces and property ownership. EFB 246
- Symbol of those who can not solve their problems alone. IFB 223S.
- Symbol of helplessness-EMA 201, EMA 209
- Symbol of a good virtuous man. EFA 230
- Symbol of naivité. EFA 223

- He is a father figure (Per=Père). IFD 503H.

The WIFE

- symbol of evil. EMA 209, EMA 206
- symbol of double-dealing. EMB 241
- symbol of scheming. EMB 241
- symbol of the new social force. EFB 246

The STEWARD

- Symbol of the new social force. EFB 246
- symbol of evil. IMC 308H, IFB 230H, EMA 212, EMB 241, EMB 238 EFA 234, EMA 227, EFA 225, EMA 209, EMA 206
- symbol of sexuality. IFB 230H.
- He is the force (internal or external) which leads men to corruption. IFB 223S.
- Symbol of ambition. EMA 224
- He is the seducer. IMB 228H.
- Symbol of brute force. EMA 201
- Symbol of cunning. EFA 233

THE OLD WOMAN

- symbol of cleverness. IMA 210H, IFC 220, EMA 201
- symbol of power.
- symbol of goodness. IFD 2, IMB 203H, EMA 212, EFB 253, EMB 238, EMA 227, EMA 206
- symbol of helpfulness. IFA 207H, IFC 302H, IFB 310H, EFB 253 EMB 249, EMB 241
- She stands for the power to struggle with the ambitious. IMC 308H, IMB 251
- symbol of something but I don't know of what. IMB 222H.
- symbol of wisdom. IFB 229H, EFA 225
- symbol of magic. EFA 225
- She is Per's conscience and his will-power to overcome obstacles. EFA 219

- She stands for those who give counsel. IMB 231H.
- The old woman is actually inside Per, symbolizing the idea that one can overcome problems by using his head, not by escaping from them. IMB 502H.
- symbol of justice. IFB 210H, IMB 232H, IMC 308H.
- symbol of the supernatural. IFB 229H, IFA 207H.
- She stands for a force which establishes moral order in society. IMD 501S.
- a symbol of those who help other people who have suffered injustice, without asking for much in return. IFB 224S.
- Symbolizes the one who forms the public opinion against the attacks on the family institution. IMC 403S.
- She is a symbol of goodness but being so, she ought not to have demanded money. IMB 203H.
- She stands for an authority which can be trusted when one is in difficulty. IFB 223S.
- She stands for supernatural aid. EMA 213

The WHIP

- symbol of something but I don't know of what. IFB 206H, IMB 222H, EFB 253
- symbol of divine justice. IMB 232H.
- symbol of manhood. IFB 229H.
- Per's assistant. EMA 211
- symbol of our determined and courageous behavior. EFA 220 EFB 251
- It is an alien symbol. IMB 216H, IFB 230H.
- symbol of sadism. IMB 228H, EFA 202
- It stands for the ruler. IMB 228H.

- symbol of evil (used to beat people). IMC 202S.
- a symbol, a means of resurrecting the values which were destroyed. IMC 404H.
- It stands for an instrument for ordering and channeling human relationships in a positive direction. IMB 305H.
- a symbol of Per's power. IFA 221H.
- symbol of the punishment dealt out for injustice or deception. IFB 224S.
- force, use of brutal power. IMC 403S.
- Man's authority over his wife. IFC 220H.
- Perhaps it's too farfetched but perhaps it symbolizes civil law. IMB 217H.
- symbol of justice. IFD 503H.
- phallic symbol. IFB 230H.
- symbol of punishment. IFC 302H, EMA 212, EMB 241, EMA 224,
- symbol of power. IMA 210H, IFB 223S, EFA 220
- symbol of enforcement. IFC 218H.

HIMPHAMP

- a symbol, but of what? IMB 204H, IFB 306H, IMD 505H, IFD 307H.
- symbol of something that doesn't exist in reality. IMC 308H, IFD 508H.
- symbol of power. IMA 102S.
- symbol of all secret and forbidden relationships. IFD 507H.
- symbol of the fact that deceitfulness is of no avail. IMB 226H, IFD 504H.

- a symbol of punishment and vengeance. IFB 301H, IMD 502H.
- a symbol of punishment that overtakes one when one acts dishonestly. IMD 501S.
- It stands for the punishment that ought to be given to the steward and the wife. EMB 243
- It stands for the trap that endangers the doers. EFA 231
- It is the means by which those who give in to their carnal desires are punished. IFB 230H.
- a symbol of sexuality. IFB 230H.
- a symbol of something one uses to achieve his ends. IFD 2, IFB 223S.

THE POT

- symbol of something, but of what? IMB 222H.
- a strange symbol. IFB 230H.
- symbol of disgusting sexuality. IFB 230H.
- symbol of suppressed sexual desires. IMC 404H.
- moral filth (sic). EMA 229
- symbol of dirt. IFC 302H.
- symbol of that which glues on incidents. IMA 103S.

THE TASKS SET TO PER

- symbol of various obstracles enccountered in life. IFD 2, EMA 211
- symbol of conspiracies.

CINS

- stand for goodness (the goodness of the man's heart (sic)). IFC 504H.

MONEY

- symbol of exchange. IFC 402S.

THE MAID'S NAKEDNESS

- symbolizes all sin. IMB 232H.

THE WOOD

- a symbol of confusion. IMB 232H.
- a symbol of happiness. IMB 228H.

THE SWAMP

- symbol of ugliness. IMB 228H.
- symbol of fear. IMB 228H.

THE FOG

- not being able to find one's way. IMB 232H.

THE SQUIRE

- he is the protector of the existing order. IMC 225H.

UNIVERSALS

A- OVERALL EVALUATION

- Everything in the story is universal. IMB 209H, EFA 218
- There is nothing universal. IFD 508H, EMA 216, EMA 217, EMB 248, EMB 245, EFA 235, EMA 210, EMA 206
- Not universal, too specific a situation. IFB 224S.
- The whole tale is culturally universal (sic). IMB 209H.
- It has a cross-cultural appeal. EFA 218
- The story is syncronically true (sic) IFD 506H.
- The plot is universal. IFB 306H.
- The theme is universal. IMA 201

B- UNIVERSAL TYPES, ROLES, PERSONNAE

- The characters are universal. (Per and the steward) IFB 306H.
- The steward is universal. IMA 103S, IFB 306H.
- The adultress is universal. IFB 230H.
- The irrational, headstrong maid is a universal character. IMB 228H.

C- UNIVERSAL ELEMENTS AND MOTIFS

- The manor house-the cottage (the setting) is universal.
- The manor house is universal. IMA 103S.
- The old woman who has supernatural powers is universal. IFD 503H, IFB 230H.
- The use of superstition is universal. IMC 202S.
- The motif of sticking to an object (like the himphamp in this story) is a universal feature seen in many fairy tales. IMC 403S.

- The fact that it incorporates all the elements of a fairy tale universalizes the story. IMC 308H.
- The supernatural elements are universal. IFA 221H, FIB 219H.
- Seeking the aid of a sorceress is universal. IFB 205H, IFB 215H, IFA 221H.
- Lucky coincidences. EMA 227
- The fact that solutions to the problems are sought with the help of the supernatural. IMC 225H.

D- UNIVERSAL RELATIONSHIPS AND INSTITUTIONS

- The mentality of the tale is universal. IFB 219H.
- This is a universal fairy tale. IFB 206H, IMC 102S.
- The fact that it is not really universal but "local" is perhaps due to the faulty style. IFB 224S
- The institution of marriage is universal. IMA 210H, IMC 404H, IMB 305H.
- The relationship of the men and women is universal. IFD 504H, IMC 225H, IMB 233H.
- All the relationships are universal. IFC 504H, IMB 203H.
- The eternal triangle is universal. IMC 202S, IMB 228H, IFC 402H, IMC 403S, IMB 226H, IFB 201H, IFD 504H, IFB 230H.
- It is a bad version of the eternal triangle. IFB 208H.
- The Manor-cottage relationship is universal. IMB 22nH.
- Squiredom is universal. IFB 229H.
- Class differences are universal. IMB 203H.
- The oppressive dominance of the upper class is universal. IMB 203H.

- Relation of the squire and an apple-polishing steward. IFB 229H.
- The chain of human relationships. IMB 227H.

E- UNIVERSAL THEMES

- The subject has something to offer to every reader in any culture. IFB 306H.
- The theme is alien, unlike any tale I've read before. IFD 307H.
- Egoism of human beings. IMC 225H.
- Perseverance. EFA 219
- Treachery. EMB 241
- Lasciviousness. (of the steward and the woman) IMC 202S.
- Incontinence.
- Wholeness of heart. EMB 241
- Mutual help. EMB 241
- Crime. IFB 306H. EFA 218
- Rewards. EFA 218
- Punishment. IFB 306H.
- Love. EFB 253, EFA 231, EFA 228
- Jealousy. EFB 253, EFA 231
- Faithfullness. EMA 229
- The theme of sexuality is universal. IFC 504H, IFB 201H.
- Betrayal. IMA 210H, EMA 229
- Cowardice. EMA 227
- That the old will always resist the new and that it will succeed in this from time to time. EFB 246
- That determined and radical revolutionary behavior is necessary to replace the old system. EFB 246
- Forgiveness. EFA 228

- Marriage. IFB 208H.
- Revenge.(vengeance) IFB 211H, IMB 222H, EFA 228
- Sin.IFB 211H
- Eroticism.IFB 211H
- Cunning.IFB 211H
- Threatening.IFB 211H
- Magic.IMB 222H, IMB 227H.
- Innocence versus cunning.IMB 226H
- A man overcoming difficulties with his intelligence. IFB 206H
- That everything is done for pecuniary rewards. IMA 210H
- To get money for services rendered.IFC 504H, EFA 233
- That men desire other men's wives.EMB 250
- Matrimonial difficulties.
- Adultery. IFD 506H, IMB 214S, IFC 309H, IMB 232H, IFB 208H, IFB 224S.
- The theme of the cuckolding of an old man by his young wife. IMD 505H, IFA 221H, IFC 220H, EMB 243, EMB 242
- That tnose who break up a home are disliked by all. IFD 2.
- Women always cuckold their husbands and their husbands are always naive. IMB 213S.
- The lovers' wanting to get rid of the husband. IMB 214S, IMB 232H.
- Old man-young woman theme. IMD 505H, EMB 243
- That there is always someone to come to the aid of the good man.EFA 220, EMA 211, C

- The theme of the good man's eventual success. IFC 504H, IFD 2, EFA 204
- The mortal struggle between good and evil. EMB 238 EMA 214
- The themes of good, evil, and punishment. IFD 503H, EMA 212
- Evil is always challenged by some force; could be God or those who love God. IMA 102S, EMA 211
- The theme of the evil man coveting what belongs to another. EMA 224
- That a great many people may set out traps for others to serve their own ends. IFD 506H, EFA 228
- Old man's struggle against those who are out to destroy him. IMC 225H.
- Evil-doing. IMB 222H. EMA 227
- Good intentions versus evil intentions. IMB 226H.
- The idea that divine justice will deal with all sin. IMB 232H, IMB 214S, IFC 309H.
- The themes of good and evil in a context of crime and punishment. IMB 217H.
- That in trying to deceive others, one deceives one's self. IFD 307H.
- Belief in supernatural forces. EFA 228

THE STYLE

- The story is made up of a sequence of simple coincidences. IFB 201H.

- The story is not well-made. IFB 201H.

- A great many similar events linked to one another. The knots are unraveled simultaneously.

- A fantastic and thin story. IMC 404H, EMA 206

- Poor in the number of incidents. IFB 224S.

- The words and the proper names are alien to our culture. IFB 301H, IFD 506H, IMD 501S.

- The theme of betrayal in marriage is alien to our culture. IFD 506H, IFC 302H.

- Acceptance of that betrayal is alien. IFC 302H.

- Too sparse a use of symbolism. IMB 216H, IMB 209H, IFD 508H.

- Badly written. The same nonsense could have been expressed in a more appealing way. IFC 304H.

- The style is really awful. IFC 304H.

- The narrator appears to have a sense of humour. IFD 506H, IFB 201H.

- The story appears to be a preliminary sketch for a story, a story with an entirely different purpose than that which appears in the sketch. IFC 402H.
- The structure is that of a fairy tale. EFB 252

- The incidents of the chamberpot and the bed are not alien to our culture, but the way these incidents are narrated most emphatically is. IFC 402H.

- Alien words like himphamp hampers the speed of reading. IFB 305H, IFB 306H.

- One has to pause and think. IFB 305H, IFB 306H.

- Himphamp is an alien word. IFC 303H.

- The thing I found most striking about the tale was its style. IFB 305H, IFB 306H.

- The game of himphamp is alien. IFA 207H.

- Funny and entertaining. IMB 217H.

- Almost satirical. IMB 217H.

- The symbolism is obscure. IFC 220H.

- The meaning doesn't get across. IFC 220H.

- Interesting, one can hardly wait to see how one episode will lead into the next. IFD 508H.

- There is some fine imagery. IFD 508H.

- It's well told. IFD 508H.

- There is no inconsistency, neither in style nor in imagery. IFD 508H.
- Due to the abundant use of fantastic elements, the meaning is lost. EFB 253
- Because of the intermingling of fantastic elements with universal elements, the universal elements fade out. EFB 252

- It has organic unity. IFD 504H.

- The narrative style is fine. IMB 213S, IMA 212S, EMB 245

- There is no indication of time and place. IMC 308H.

- For whom is a story of this sort intended? Who is the intended audience? IFB 301H.

- It is too confusing, meaningless, without any warmth; (the plot is absurd, haphazard and divorced from reality.) EMA 222 EMA 213
  - It does not try to get anything across to the reader, has no appeal. EFA 219
  - Suitable for those under the age of 10. EMA 222
  - The same message could have been given without the elements of sexuality and nakedness, using more socially acceptable norms. EMA 226

- The way the story is presented is not nice.

- Entertaining. IFB 306H, IFB 201H, IFD 508H, EMB 245

- I read it with interest to the end. The tempo is nice and fast and there is suspense. IMD 502H.

- Difficult to understand at a first reading. IMB 222H.

- I liked neither the plot nor the style. IFD 307H.

- The style is weird.

- The whole story is padded. IFB 224S.

- It is unnecessarily overlong. IFB 224S, EMA 214
- It is an exaggerated story (sic). EFA 225

- The himphamp chain is too long. IFB 224S.

- The story appears to be addressed to people of low social and educational level.

- It is alien to our culture though it is contemporary. IMB 214S.
- It is alien. EMB 244
- Obscure , confused style. IFC 220H.

- The descriptions are inadequate. IFC 220H.

- There are inconsistencies. IFC 220H, EMA 214

- The story is monotonous. IFD 304H, IFB 224S.

- The handling is strange and confused. IFB 224S, EMA 214

- The rhythm of the narrative is as monotorous as the ticking of a metronome.

- The beginning is like a crime story. IFB 223S.

- An illogical story. IFC 218H, IMA 210H, EMA 222

- A loud story (sic). IMA 210H.

- The events are not tied in with one another. IMA 210H.

- A well-told, witty story. IFD 508H.

- I fail to perceive a tension in the story resolving itself in a happy ending. IFC 402H, EMA 214

- I find parts of the story alien, for example the relationship of Per, the steward and the squire in their social and hierarchical context. IFB 219H.

- This story has really disturbed me, but I think it is not my fault but because of the way the tale is narrated. IFB 224S.

- Unnecessary details are belabored while details which need explanation are passed over. Eg. we are not sure what the old woman stands for, why the squire and his wife appear at the end; how is it possible that Per and his wife live happily ever after? IFB 224S.

- The maid grabbed a handful of grass...the old cow...the bull jumped on the cow":

  - This is a very poor image.

- The whole tale is alien to my social milieu. IMA 102S, IMB 216H.

- According to Turkish norms, punishment inflicted on the steward and the woman is too light. IMD 501S.

- What is a "himphamp"? IFD 506H, IFB 223S, IFD 503H, IMA 103S, IMB 213S, IFB 211S, IMA 212S, IFB 219H, IFC 402H, IMC 404H, IMB 214S, IFD 508H, IMD 502H, IMD 501S, IMB 227H, IFC 309H.

- "Himphamp" might mean an utmost impossibility. IFD 508H.

- güruh" (crowd, p.11, 1.8):

  - I don't know what this word means. IFB 211S. (a word one

rarely encounters either in speech or writing nowadays).

- "Çil paralarla döşenmiş" (paved with gold coins):
  - This expression is wrong. IMA 212S.
  - I liked this expression. IMA 210H.

- I think it is a translation. IFC 402H, IMC 403S, IFC 302H, EFB 246

- Unnecessarily muddled. IFC 402H, IMC 403S, IMB 216H, EFB 246

- "tut" and "tutmak" (stick and to stick) are used over and over again, needlessly.

- "Your wife needs to relieve herself and will reach out for the chamber pot":
  - terribly vulgar.

- The incident of the wife and the chamber pot:
  - The whole paragraph is very unpleasant. IFC 309H.

- "Hello, my lion":
  - out of place and irrelevant. IFC 309H.

- Coming across the cows, etc.:
  - has nothing to do with the story, superfluous. IFC 309H.

- Words and idioms are badly chosen. IFC 309H.

- The last paragraphs are padded. IFC 309H.

- "I never learned to pave..." style is poor.

- The use of the historical past tense implies that the narrator has heard the story from some one else.

- "Karı" is an improper word to use. IMA 210H.

- Parts of the story are unliterary, rendened in colloquial speech.

- The language is simple and unadorned, there is nothing problematic about it. IFB 305H, IFB 306H.

- "Yoksa Per'e günah olurmuş" (that would be a pity, p.1, l.25):
  - The style is awkward. IFC 220H.
  - Granmatically wrong. IFC 220H.
  - Sounds like a badly translated sentence. IFC 220H.

- The cow going for the grass between the maid's legs:
  - Exaggerated. IFC 220H, IFB 211S.
  - The narrator is trying to be funny by going after exaggerated details. IFC 220H, IFB 211S.

- p.3, l.23 :
  - It is wrong for the steward to express himself in these words. It ought to read "How could he have possibly done it" (bu işi nasıl becerebilirdi?). IMA 212S.

- Bunu tabii yapamam: Hayatımda ağaç dikmeyi öğrenmedim: (=to plant trees, p.4, ll.13-15):
  - Badly put.
  - And Per actually ought to have thought, "How could I accomplish this task in twenty four hours?" (The reader sees a logical flaw here).

- The squire's speech beginning "Hello Per":
  - It is actually unclear who utters these words.

- Widower": ("dul"-In Tk. "dul" stands for both widow and widower):
  - The term is used in Turkish for women rather than men. IFB 211S, IMA 212S. (The reader appears to be right).

- "Böylece yeniden ormanda koşmaya başlamış" (p.4, 11.19-20 So he began to run through the wood once more):
  - The way the sentence is constructed is utterly funny. IFB 211S.

"kesif" (dense p.5, 1.13):
  - I don't know what the word means. IFB 211S. (an old word nowadays superceded by "yoğun").

- I found the mingling of the old and the new (in terms of language) very congenial.

- "Başka ne onu tutarsa" (anyone else who touches it, p.8, 1.14):
  - Strange, the wording is muddled. IFD 507H, IMD 502H.

- The fact that the squire went outside is stated too many times in various ways. IFC 220H.
  - Unnecessary. IFC 220H.

- In places we have direct speech, and then sections narrated in the passive voice. IFB 305H, IFB 306H.

- The historical past tense is typical for the language of fairy tales. IFB 305H, IFB 306H.

- It does not reflect modern Turkish usage, it sounds dated. IFB 305H, IFB 306H.

- At each sentence I kept thinking that the sentence could have been expressed differently. IFC 402H.

- It is a bad translation. IFC 402H, IFD 503H.

- (the reader made this comment at page 7):

  - The language of the story does not appeal to me. IFC 402H.

- It looks as if the translator forced himself to be faithful to the letter of the original text. IFC 402H, IFD 503H.

  - The vocabulary is bland and makes frequent use of words difficult to perceive at once. IFC 402H.

  - For example, "halletmek" and "katletmek" (2nd paragraph "kill, murder"). Here it might have been better to use simpler language or something. IFC 402H.

- The persistent use of the same verb tense makes the tale more difficult to read rather than simplifying the process. IFC 402H.

- "Pek tabii ben de ölmek istemiyorum" (p.3, "that surely he was unwilling to lose"). What is the point of adding the suffix "de" to "ben"? IFC 402H.

- I find the use of the historical past tense very annoying. IFC 402H.

- Since himphamp is not a personal noun, it is wrong to add an apasthrophe before the suffix. (this occurs in several places). IMD 214S.

- Old cows:
  - It is wrong to use the adjective "old"=yaşlı for cows. IB 214S. (The student is right! "Yaşlı" means aged and refers exclusively to human beings. "Kocamış" might be a better word to use instead).

- Instead of "bu iş amma da tatsiz oldu" (=what an annoying thing it is" p.3, 1.23). The text ought to have read "hiç iyi olmadı". IMB 213S.

- The repetitive use of "tabii" (which occurs in Per's conversation with the old woman) sounds bad-this repetition ought to have been avoided. IMB 213S.

- The first sentence of the 3rd paragraph:
  - It is not clear who is addressing who. IMA 212S, IMB 214S.

- 2nd sentence:
  - The use of "karı" (woman, carries a negative valence in Tk.)is not a very polite way of expressing things. IFC 309H, IMC 404H, IFC 402H, IMB 402H, IMB 213S, IFB 208H.
  - Ought to have read "kadın". IMB 213S, IFB 208H.
  - "Karı" implies that woman is a chattel. IMB 213S, IFD 2.
  - The narrator is a male chauvenist pig. IFD 2.

- The word "katletmek" (murder) is an obsolete verb which bothers the reader. IMB 213S.

- It resembles a fairy tale.IFB 306H, EFB 253

- It resembles a fairy tale but it could not be categorized as one. IFC 220H.

- Children are generally not subjected to such grossness. IFC 220H.

- I don't like it because it is too much like a fairy tale. IMB 214S.EMA 209
- I like it because the fantastic elements make the story interesting. EFA 220, EMA 217, EMA 216
- Written to entertain. IMB 214S.

- Intended for children. IMB 214S. EFB 253

- Looking at the story from the child's angle, I find the grass between the legs and the bull trying to mount the cow going to the extreme. IFB 224S.

- The language and the style are not that of a fairy tale although it contains fairy tale elements. IFC 302H.

- The language and the style are not that of a fairy tale. At least not like the tales I'm used to. But I read it without any difficulty. At least it does contain supernatural elements as a fairy tale should. IFB 219H.

--The story has details like urinating, mating, nakedness which are not found in classical fairy tales. IMB 217H.

- Like a fairy tale, contains supernatural elements. IFB 215H.

- A narrative which kindles the imagination through the use of the supernatural. IMB 203H.
-- A narrative which pacifies the reader by putting him in a state of dreams and illusions. It intends to pacify the society.(sic) EMA 232
- It doesn't make one think because of its fairy tale structure.EFA 231

- A narrative which fails to kindle the imagination through the use of the supernatural. IMC 404H.

- It is too episodic. IMB 214S.

- The stroy is episodic, so it can be expanded even further. IFC 218H.

- A great many improbable events take place. IFB 201H.

- It makes one think. IFB 201H.
- The language is fluent. EMB 245
- The style is like that of the 1001 Nights. IFC 218H.

- The reader likes the story because it is didactic, it contains the elements of fantasy and also for its novelty.

- It is not didactic enough as some similar tales are. IMB 305H.

- The reader dislikes the story because of the elements of fantasy and illusion. IFD 307H, EMA 222

- Children will love it. There are many comical incidents. IFD 503H.

- The narrator makes poor use of the fairy tale elements. IFB 224S.

- Fairy tales are generally written for children but this one is too pornographic for them. IMD 501S.

- The use of fantastic elements are like those in fairy tales. IFC 303H, IFD 503H.

- Therefore it is boring, IFD 503H.

- The fantastic elements:
  - These signify that when men can not overcome a difficulty in real life, they overcome these with the help of the supernatural in their dreams(i.e. wish fulfillment). These elements do not impair the force of the narrative.

- There is nothing educational about the story. IFC 304H.

- The use of number three is a folkloristic motif . IFC 302H.

- It is not a good fairy tale. IFC 302H.

- A "well made" fairy tale: There is a beginning, a middle and an end and the element of suspense. IFD 503H.

- The resolution of the triangle relation in a positive way through the help of the supernatural is not the subject matter of a fairy tale.IMC 403S.

- It is like a fairy tale but it has no appeal for grown ups and hardly suitable for children. IMA 102S.

- It is not didactic. IMB 216H, EFA 230
- It is didactic.EMB 247
- Moreover, the style is not rationalistic (sic) and it gives the impression of commanding the reader to think in a certain direction. IFC 402H.

- The incidents are too rationalistically motivated. IFD 506H.

- The supernatural events are put in a rationalistic framework which dominates the supernatural. IFD 506H.